

European 12 Competition – PORTUGAL: Porto Brandão/Almada and Vila Viçosa sites

Jury report

The jury met in two sessions, on 4 and 5 October 2013 and December 1, 2013, for the evaluation of the received projects and the assignment of classification and awards. The Jury members were in both meetings fully present at all times:

Nuno Portas , President of the Jury

Robert Stüssi

Diego Jiménez Lopes

Samuel Torres de Carvalho

Francisco Aires Mateus

Nuno Grande

Ana Lemos (substitute, replacing João Nunes).

Prof. Pedro Brandão, Secretary General of the European Portugal and the Technical Committee representative, also participated at the meetings as reporter, without voting rights.

1. The Process

The first meeting of the Jury was preceded by a Technical Commission meeting, held on September 11, 2013, to audit the compliance of tenders with the competition Rules and Program briefs. This meeting was reported in the form of assessment charts, one for each proposal, passing the compliance of the 64 proposals received.

The first working session of the Jury took place on 4 and 5 October 2013 in Lisbon and was preceded by a visit to Porto Brandão, Almada to the local competition site. In this first session, the jury evaluated the proposals globally, taking into account notes received from the Technical Committee regarding compliance to program, and general criteria of Regulations:

- Conceptual content;
- Contributions in terms of innovation reported to the general theme of European - European urbanity and new challenges - adaptability.

After discussion based on the criteria, the vote resulted in the selection of a shortlist of about 20 % of the proposals (9 and 5 for Almada and Vila Viçosa proposals respectively (Annex 1). A synthetic comment of the Jury evaluation grounds of each proposal was registered.

At the international benchmarking Forum of Cities and Juries held in Paris, 1 and 2 November 2013, all the selected proposals were present, and the Jury delegated its representation on Samuel Torres de Carvalho who participated in the comparative discussion - as a generally shared agreement on the relevance of adaptability as a sustainability assessment topic.

After the Paris Forum, the Technical Committee held a second meeting on November 28, 2013, with the aim to report to the Jury on the possibilities and feasibility for the implementation of

the procedure results. In the final evaluation of tenders, it may be taken into account for this purpose, framed in the evaluation criteria, as:

- Relevance to the brief objectives on the site;
- Potential for integration in complex urban process;

Thus the technical verification of the proposals selected by the jury in the first phase of selection was assessed on those criteria. A proposal for inclusion of the proposal Relinking Structures - Almada in the selection for the 2nd jury review, was recommended.

2. Final Jury Meeting - Resolutions

At the final meeting of the jury, held on December 1, 2013, the jury discussed in detail the 10 proposals preselected for Almada (including Relinking Structures) and 5 preselected for Vila Viçosa, evaluating them in accordance with the criteria laid down in Regulations with equal weighting:

- The relationship between the concept and the site;
- Relevance to the theme issues - sustainable development issues and Adaptability;
- Relevance of the program in relation to its programmatic goals of the site;
- Potential for integration in complex urban process;
- Innovative aspects of the proposed public spaces;
- Attention given to the relationship between housing and other functions;
- Architectural qualities;
- Technical qualities.

After this evaluation the jury unanimously decided to award 2 winner prizes , 2 runner-up prizes and 1 special mention , justifying it with a comment on each and all proposals (Annex 2).

Almada - PORTO BRANDÃO

Winner: Porto Novo 270° Landscape, Regeneration of an Urban Sequence

Runner-up: Punctuation

Special Mention: Linha do Tempo - Timeline Herança vs Mutabilidade

VILA VIÇOSA

Winner: Between Landscapes

Runner-up: Tupperware Party

Finally, the jury took note of the information received from the Câmara Municipal de Vila Viçosa by the Board of European Portugal, in face of which the jury decided to keep the assigned classification and strongly recommended that every effort should be made so as to provide adequate national and international dissemination of the results by promoting a national event of prize-giving and giving the opportunity for the possible development of winning proposals options of adaptability.

Nuno Portas, President of the Jury

European 12 Competition – PORTUGAL: Porto Brandão/Almada and Vila Viçosa sites

Jury report

Annex 1 - Shortlisted proposals

ALMADA – PORTO BRANDÃO

Potenciar o Local

Regeneração de Tecidos

Reuse Brandão

Porto Novo 270° Landscape, Regeneration of an Urban Sequence

REidentity: REconnect, REconstruct, REestablish

Reaction

Network Fields

Relinking Structures

Linha do Tempo - Timeline Herança vs Mutabilidade

Punctuation

VILA VIÇOSA

Pedras das Estradas

Between the Layers of Time

A Landscape Structure

Tupperware Party

Between Landscapes

European 12 Competition – PORTUGAL: Porto Brandão/Almada and Vila Viçosa sites

Jury report

Annex 2 - Comments on proposals

The jury decided that all proposals, pre-selected or not, shall have their jury comments published on a complete version until end December, on Portuguese national website:

www.europanportugal.pt. **For the announcement of results the following comments support the grounds of decision:**

Awards - PORTO BRANDÃO

1st Prize/Winner PORTO BRANDÃO - Porto Novo 270° Landscape, Regeneration of an Urban Sequence

By betting on a low density solution and using the landscape as a work tool, by remodelling, reusing and reinforcing its values, transformation is processed by a diversified strategy that opens up the options of adaptability.

The landscape transformation option, through extensive cultivation of vines, the work on the riverfront, with a new geometry and a strong image for the new "port", reveals a reactivation capacity, and promotes a "renewed" identity. In the riverside industrial area the dismantling of existing deposits and using of the resulting space for a huge amphitheatre for public use transforms the landscape linking it with Lisbon (although with undersized parking facilities) .

Runner-up PORTO BRANDÃO - Punctuation

The project responds positively to the brief objectives. It provides a clear and novel strategic based solutions by using either the removal or the rebuilding, and further recovery of pre-existing matrix, reveals the unique potential and concept feasibility in its adaptable vision.

The proposal demonstrates sensitivity in detailing the various use programs, particularly in its relationship with topography and pre - existing urban fabric and it communicates different "environments" with great care and detail, with an expression that gives credibility to a possible implementation process.

Special Mention PORTO BRANDÃO - Linha do Tempo - Timeline Herança vs Mutabilidade

The proposal faces with great ability the formalization of various brief programs, with particular focus on the low altimetry installations. The Urban Design solution with the proposed plaza and the functional reuse of industrial infrastructure (oil deposits) is still in establishing separate connections to high level area of occupation.

The various solutions are clearly represented and communicated, making their feasibility clear. Design adaptability lies secured by ways of allowing phasing in implementation.

Awards - VILA VIÇOSA

1st Prize/Winner VILA VIÇOSA - Between Landscapes

The conceptual content of the proposal is interesting and meeting program objectives, by using elements that mark the passing of time, although in some cases it is not clearly justified, given the idea of adaptability. Treated in a timely manner and in the interests of a less rigid assembly, several proposals have solutions for upgrading existing elements to future uses,

seeking to respond to the various brief goals, including the proposed use of the railway infrastructure.

The redevelopment of the village entrance looks interesting by proposing an open space (reception) and in its implementation prioritizing, upgrading or phasing can be given, particularly in the treatment of micro climate issues (vegetation), and the careful sitting of new elements.

Runner-up VILA VIÇOSA - Tupperware Party

The conceptual content was considered interesting and contextualized in the local community as well as items referring to issues of diverse cultural identity. Regarding the issue of adaptability, the main space created as a reinvention of a “square” at the entrance of the Village, as well as the areas adjacent to it, offer diversified and multipurpose uses. However the interesting solution of square huge covering is solved as a structure to promote improvements in microclimatology, it proves to be an essential element, although being too costly it compromises the proposals adaptability.

The proposal is not sufficiently clear regarding the response to other objectives (notably tourism), developed in somewhat incoherent drawing or unconvincing way.