

# **EUROPAN 17** Living cities

# REPORT OF THE FRENCH JURY

First jury round
October 17 and 18, 2023

Second jury round
November 16 and 17, 2023

Written by Emmanuel REDOUTEY
Urban designer
Member of the assessment committee

# Summary

1.	ANALYSIS OF PROJECTS BY THE EXPERT ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE	3
	Project assessment	3
2.	FIRST JURY PHASE	4
	COURCY GRAND REIMS	6
	MÉTROPOLE ROUEN NORMANDIE	8
	FLEURANCE	
	BERNAY – TERRE DE NORMANDIE	11
	NANTES	12
	MARSEILLE	14
	RENNES METROPOLE	
	GRENOBLE ALPES MÉTROPOLE	17
	GUÉRANDE	
	LE PALAIS – BELLE-ÎLE-EN-MER	20
3.	SECOND JURY PHASE	23
	COURCY – GRAND REIMS	23
	LE PALAIS – BELLE-ÎLE-EN-MER	25
	MÉTROPOLE ROUEN NORMANDIE	
	FLEURANCE	
	GUÉRANDE	28
	MARSEILLE	
	NANTES	
	GRENOBLE ALPES MÉTROPOLE	
	BERNAY – TERRE DE NORMANDIE	
	RENNES MÉTROPOLE	34
4.	ALLOCATION OF PRIZES	36
	Winning projects	
	Runner-up projects	
	Special mention projects	37
	List of award-winning projects and jury oninion	38

# 1. ANALYSIS OF PROJECTS BY THE EXPERT ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE

# **Project assessment**

Ahead of the first jury, EUROPAN France's independent expert committee carried out an initial evaluation of the **202 projects** submitted with a view to proposing a shortlist and preparing the ground for the jury debates. Comprising 10 members and a coordinator, the committee has several roles: to analyse all the documents submitted by the candidates, to report the teams' comments, to evaluate the projects with respect to the session theme and the site briefs, to identify families of projects and salient ideas and attitudes. The committee then submits a proposed shortlist to the jury and assists it in its debates and discussions with the Municipalities.

Each expert was assigned a site and pairings of experts and sites were formed to ensure a dual perspective on each project submitted. The expert responsible for each site was tasked with writing the coss-analysis, an opinion on each of the projects and detailed assessments of the shortlisted projects. The experts worked together at a 2-day seminar on 31st August and 1st September 2023.

# **Project analysis**

The assessment committee analysed the proposals in terms of the relevance of the response to the session theme, its relevance to the site and its capacity to fit in with a post-competition project process. Shortlisted projects had to:

- Show a distinctive quality of innovation with regard to the theme, in their questions and/or in their response, at one or more levels (urban, architectural, processual, conceptual or theoretical).
- Offer a pertinent and original response to the brief in terms of their strategy, process and consideration of the territorial, architectural and environmental heritage of each site.

#### Assessment criteria

Project assessment is based on five criteria. This is not a fixed framework and the projects proposed for shortlisting do not necessarily have to stand out on every one of these criteria.

- Contributions to the theme of living cities: relevance and originality of the theoretical approach, referencing and positioning with respect to global issues or contemporary currents of thought;
- Anchorage in the territory, the site and its uses: consideration of the context and the natural, urban, territorial and environmental legacy, capacity to take advantage of the qualities and resources of the territory;
- Modes of action/methods of doing things: relevance of tools and resources, capacity to involve public or private actors, operational potential and capacity of the project to be part of the competition;
- Architectural and landscape proposals: relevance, quality and originality of architectural or formal proposals.

# Number of projects submitted and proposed for shortlisting

Sites	Number of projects submitted this	Number of projects proposed for shortlisting
BERNAY - TERRE DE NORMANDIE	23	6
COURCY – GRAND REIMS	18	5
FLEURANCE	28	7
GRENOBLE ALPES MÉTROPOLE	14	5
GUÉRANDE	17	5
LE PALAIS – BELLE-ÎLE-EN-MER	28	7
MARSEILLE	18	6
NANTES	27	7
RENNES	18	5
MÉTROPOLE ROUEN NORMANDIE	11	5
10 SITES	202 projects	58 (i.e. 29% of submitted projects)

# 2. FIRST JURY PHASE

# **OCTOBER 17 and 18, 2023**

Plateforme de la création architecturale, Cité de l'architecture et du patrimoine

The first round of the French Europan 17 jury was conducted at the Plateforme de la création architecturale (architectural design platform) at the Cité de l'architecture et du patrimoine in Paris.

Alain MAUGARD, President of Europan France, welcomed the jury, recalled the European dimension of the competition and emphasised the value of a second session on the theme of Living Cities to explore the theme of E16 in greater depth in E17. In the second round, the Europan France jury would select 3 teams per site to take part in the next phase of the competition and in the implementation phase. For this reason, it was important for the selected proposals to be diverse and complementary. On this basis, the jury would select 30 projects for 10 sites, then award prizes (Winner, Runner-up, Special Mention) to recognise the ideas and teams at national and European level. Europan must "continue to amaze" and be a source of "innovation in communities" through out of the ordinary projects. The jury needed to be particularly attentive to the municipalities and the preferences they express, but would remain sovereign in its decisions.

**François LECLERC**, Chair of the Europan 17 jury, opened the session. As a former winner of PAN in 1982, he expressed his affection and admiration for this long-lived competition. "PAN" expresses the idea of a whole and a totality. It also encompasses the concept of synthesis or globality. Above all, for him this suffix conveys the idea of "transversality in the project process" which invites us to "go beyond the initial brief, to look elsewhere, higher, further or closer...". In short, Europan invites us to "be exploratory and inventive...".

But how can we show even more imagination in facing the succession of crises (climate, health, etc.) that we are experiencing? François Leclerc invited us to go beyond the idea of crisis because this presupposes a beginning and an end. We are facing a "radical change". For our cities that are too mineral, too hot, tired of permanent modification, sometimes exhausted, one of the answers consists in "turning to the earth". The guidelines of the Climate and Resilience Law, of Zero Net Artificialization and rewilding, are a step in the right direction. But we must always remember the importance of the question of housing and industry in this new situation. We need to construct a "theory of land shortage" and experiment with complexity in our approach to "cities that are too dense and must therefore find support elsewhere" and "cities that are not dense enough and must therefore invent new forms of project".

François Leclerc concluded by thanking Isabelle Moulin, the Europan France team and the assessment committee, to which he gave the floor.

**Malaury FORGET,** coordinator of the Europan 17 assessment committee explained the method of project analysis and the salient ideas of the session. After E16, E17 "Living Cities 2" brings two new components to the topic: the relationship between architecture and environment, and the idea of *care*. She gave a reminder of the French sites incorporated in the European sub-themes:

- Let the birds sing! Reimagining public space as a biodiverse landscape: Grenoble Alpes Métropole, Guérande, Le Palais, Métropole Rouen Normandy, Marseille
- Imagine a second life! Transforming neighbourhoods and buildings towards an inclusive environment: Fleurance, Nantes, Rennes, Bernay Terres de Normandie, Courcy Grand Reims

The teams' responses highlight the specificities and contributions of this session to the theme of living cities:

- New tools for designers, communities and users to give voice to living things
- New attitudes towards the living world: self-regenerating living things, living things to care for/to give care
- Going beyond operational and political temporalities to better take into account the timeframe of the living world
- The bioregion as a relevant scale for living cities
- Soil, topography and water as vectors of life and material for projects

# METHOD AND CONDUCT OF THE FIRST PHASE OF THE JURY

#### For each site:

- Presentation by site representatives of their expectations and concerns
- Presentation of the projects proposed for shortlisting by the assessment committee
- Opinion of the Municipality and possible addition of projects not picked by the assessment committee
- Discussion between the jury members and the site representatives, possible additions by the jury members of projects not picked by the assessment committee
- Discussion time between site representatives and jury

At the end of the debate between the jury members and with the site representatives, the jury conducts a secret vote to confirm the shortlisted projects.

# <u>NB</u>:

Upon receipt of the project panels (July 31, 2023), the jury members and the participating communities received an access and download link for the 202 projects submitted, followed on October 2, 2023 – i.e. 2 weeks before the first round of jury sessions – by a link to the assessment documents and the shortlist proposals.

In the course of the two days, the jury members were able to consult all the documents submitted by the 202 teams (panels and descriptions). In addition, for each site, the jury was shown the content of the site fact sheet and the panels of the projects proposed for shortlisting.

#### **COURCY GRAND REIMS**

#### Projects proposed for shortlisting

DP975 JEU DE SOCIÉTÉ(S)
PV448 MICROCOSME FERTILE
RJ033 SOLSTICE OU LE CONTRAT VIVANT
SD149 RASE-MOTTES
VJ312 OPERATION RE.MEDIATION

# Other projects <u>proposed for consideration</u>

by the site representatives: BS175 MACRORAINBOW EV487 GEOBASE 112 HJ863 MICROVILLE FERTILE

#### Projects selected by the jury

BS175 MACRORAINBOW
DP975 JEU DE SOCIÉTÉ(S)
EV487 GEOBASE 112
RJ033 SOLSTICE OU LE CONTRAT VIVANT
SD149 RASE-MOTTES
VJ312 OPERATION RE.MEDIATION

# Presentation of the site by its representatives

The Municipality of Courcy (pop. 1200) acquired the site of the former base 112, disused since 2011, for a symbolic euro. The idea of reoccupying the site, proposed by the leaders of the Microville 112 project, caught the interest of the Municipal Council which embarked on the venture with the ambition of reusing the existing heritage and creating new jobs. The idea of reviving a 70 ha micro-city on this site gives meaning to this sleepy military district. It is a project that has value for elected officials but also for the population: the Town Hall has created a citizens' committee which has now formed a civil society organisation and is fully integrated into the project management bodies.

The representative of SCIC Microville 112 presented the main aims of the project and the desire for a partnership between the municipality, industry and agriculture in devising the transformation of the site. He emphasised the major priorities of eco-rehabilitation, water management and energy control.

# Presentation of projects by the assessment committee

5 projects out of 18 were put forward for shortlisting. The assessment committee identified 3 project families:

- "tool projects" including DP975 JEU DE SOCIÉTÉ(S),
- "project-programmes" which choose a central programmatic line (e.g. an agricultural park), including PV448 MICROCOSME FERTILE, RJ033 SOLSTICE and VJ312 OPERATION RE.MEDIATION,
- "new city models" (majority of responses) which seek to recreate a mixed and dynamic neighbourhood, with a particular focus on housing, including SD149 RASE-MOTTES.

#### Reviews by site representatives

All of the projects were looked at by a group made up of elected officials and members of the SCIC (general interest cooperative), including residents involved in the project. This group was very appreciative of the work and commitment of the Europan teams. The municipality agreed with the shortlisting of two projects and was considering a third:

- DP975 JEU DE SOCIÉTÉ(S) does not answer all the questions but it is an interesting proposal that can be combined with other proposals. The project is seen as a toolbox that fits well into the existing method. It tackles the challenges of coordination, phasing and progressive reoccupation with several investors and project leaders.
- SD149 RASE-MOTTES: project considered interesting despite reservations about the visual choices.
- VJ312 OPERATION RE.MEDIATION was not understood by the local actors.

The municipalities identified three other projects that it wanted to be considered:

- EV487 GEOBASE 112: the project combines responsible and modern agriculture and energy solutions.
- HJ863 MICROVILLE FERTILE: with a similar approach, this project responds to the desire to accommodate urban or "intermediate" agriculture.
- BS175 MACRORAINBOW drew right child was very clean right the attention of all the people who analysed the projects for its work on recovery, eco-rehabilitation, resource management and consideration of transport issues. The project respects the objectives of the SCIC and offers interesting work on buildings.

# Debate and opinion of the jury

# Summary of viewpoints expressed

- The jury generally agreed with the opinion of the assessment committee and noted the diversity and quality of the responses on this site. It highlighted three issues: a territorial issue for the reoccupation of a site strangely disconnected from the city; the collaborative and civic dimension already in place, which is complemented by the Europan process; the preservation and reuse of iconic architecture.
- It welcomed the concern for sharing and the principle of local consultation implemented by the municipality with project leaders, residents and the citizens' organisation. Given the size of the site and the importance of the buildings, it wondered how the municipality could go about raising awareness among the population? Answer: regular exchanges with representatives of the population were a way to establish working habits.
- The upcoming project raises issues of land frugality and the de-artificialization of land. Two attitudes could be seen emerging: certain projects which seek to "maximize the programme" for a fairly large segment of the site; others, more attentive to land frugality, develop a more humble approach. The site representatives reiterated their concern to maintain abundant green spaces and the priority given to the reuse of existing buildings.
- For the rest of the process, the SCIC representative indicated that the community would retain control and ownership of the land with the use of long-term leases in order to perpetuate the values espoused by local actors.
- Several members of the jury underlined that the site generates something of a contrast of project approaches, giving meaning to an operational and collaborative process already in place with certain proposals bringing a poetic dimension. They were sensitive to projects that reveal the "soul of the site" with non-conformist answers to the question of the living world.
- Finally, the jury regretted that connection to the village of Courcy, accessibility and links with the town or other urban centres, among others, were poorly addressed by the teams.

# Opinions on projects proposed for shortlisting

- DP975 JEU DE SOCIÉTÉ(S): the project was considered interesting in terms of method and tools, and worth looking at more closely to better measure its contributions to the session theme.
- PV448 MICROCOSME FERTILE: the addition of new construction was not really justified.
- RJ033 SOLSTICE OU LE CONTRAT VIVANT: the team responds with a certain humility and develops an analysis that is part historical vision and part spatial vision; it is a non-conformist response which constructs a story about the fertility of the soil and the project's embeddedness in the territory.
- SD149 RASE-MOTTES: the jury perceived a great richness in the proposal, which is reflected in the graphic representation; it is a response that is both pragmatic and sophisticated and requires a certain effort of analysis and understanding.
- VJ312 OPERATION RE.MEDIATION: the team adopts a very original vision which does not turn its back on the history of the site. The reading and interpretation of the site's Legacy is very interesting. The idea of territorial responsibility resonates with the challenges of ecological transition in response to the degradation of natural and living environments. A question remains about the support and implementation of such a project.

# Opinion on other projects brought for consideration by the Municipality or by the jury

- BS175 MACRORAINBOW: the assessment committee argued that the project remains limited in its scope and constitutes a collection of programme proposals. The jury wanted to analyse this project no in greater depth in recognition of the Municipality's interest, by going beyond the seductive effects of the photorealistic image.
- EV487 GEOBASE 112: an interesting proposal in the same family of predominantly agricultural projects (idea of a sustainable agriculture campus).
- HJ863 MICROVILLE FERTILE: with the same starting point as EV487 GEOBASE 112 (soil and educational practices), the project appears less successful.

# Final jury shortlist

Following a discussion in front of the panels and a vote:

Among the projects proposed by the assessment committee, the jury chose:

- <u>for shortlisting</u>: DP975 JEU DE SOCIÉTÉ(S), RJ033 SOLSTICE OU LE CONTRAT VIVANT, SD149 RASE-MOTTES and VJ312 OPERATION RE.MEDIATION.
- not shortlisted: PV448 FERTILE MICROCOSM

# Among the other projects put forward for consideration, the jury chose:

- for shortlisting: BS175 MACRORAINBOW and EV487 GEOBASE 112
- not shortlisted: HJ863 FERTILE MICROVILLE

#### MÉTROPOLE ROUEN NORMANDIE

#### Projects proposed for shortlisting

HA373 SOFT BANKS
IQ764 AUX FIBRES DE L'EAU
R\$492 BLEUS ÉGARDS
UB234 PRICK THE BUBBLE
VZ408 MARGINALE

#### Other projects proposed for consideration

by the site representatives: LG243 - SUR LES CHEMINS DE TRAVERSE - ON THE BYWAYS

# Projects selected by the jury

HA373 SOFT BANKS
IQ764 AUX FIBRES DE L'EAU
RS492 BLEUS ÉGARDS
UB234 PRICK THE BUBBLE
VZ408 MARGINALE

#### Presentation of the site by its representatives

The Europan site is located upstream of Rouen and the areas that host the large port and industrial functions, which tend to extend to the west. Little work has been done on this "upstream territory" to date. The community senses that there is potential here for further progress over the years to come. Ideas are being considered with a focus on anticipating and exploring solutions linked to flooding and sea level rise and their impact on the mouth of the Seine. More locally, this site is perceived as a "cordon territory", a strip of land that is a focal point for issues about relations between the hillside and the river.

# Presentation of projects by the assessment committee

5 projects out of 11 were proposed for shortlisting. The assessment committee identified several common intersecting themes in the teams' responses: the adaptation and maintenance of local economic activities (construction, textiles), flow management, work on public spaces and the relationship to the land gradient, relations between the river banks. There were three types of projects: (1) restructuring projects, (2) one-off interventions, (3) toolboxes.

# Reviews by site representatives

Among the projects shortlisted by the experts:

- the community noted two projects in particular, IQ764 AUX FIBRES DE L'EAU and VZ408 MARGINALE, perceived as sensitive and adaptable proposals, which work "in small steps" in conjunction with local stakeholders. These two projects showed modesty and frugality in their interventions, particularly on plants.
- It was also in agreement with the shortlisting proposal for RS492 BLEUS ÉGARDS, UB234 PRICK THE BUBBLE, VZ408 MARGINALE (global approach and consideration of flooding, relationship to the river).
- Reservations were expressed about HA373 SOFT BANKS, which did not correspond to the community's initial
  intentions and seemed complex to implement (an excessively accelerated vision of the transition to hydrogen, the
  reactivation of a dead arm of the river).

The community wanted consideration to be given to one non-shortlisted project:

• LG243 - SUR LES CHEMINS DE TRAVERSE - ON THE BYWAYS attracted attention for its work on transversal connections, the idea of "connecting with what is no longer seen" and its reflection on time and its choices of non-intervention.

#### Jury debate

Summary of the viewpoints expressed by the jury

• The jury underlined the importance of this site and of the question associated with it, with several embedded themes: the situation upstream of Rouen, the relationship with the river, flooding (though few projects address the

risk), the beauty of the landscape and its preservation, which challenges even the need for intervention, the stitching work required, the connection between the plateaus, the hills, the banks and the other bank...

- The site is currently very difficult to read, with invisible landscape qualities. It poses a geographical challenge with several factors needing to be addressed: the presence of the forest, the treatment of the slope and the approach to height differences in the proposals (too few cross-section drawings in the submissions). Being close to Rouen, it also has a historical dimension. In response to a question from the jury, the community explained that local people are becoming attached to this site, which has become a place for visits and recreational activities.
- The jury noted IQ764 AUX FIBRES DE L'EAU and HA373 SOFT BANKS, two very different proposals in terms of landscape interpretation and structure. They illustrate a new type of urban planning conceived for this kind of composite, somewhat unstructured territory.
- The jury found value in transversal approaches to the site, while the proposals that accentuate its linearity ignore the forms of living space. In this respect, IQ764 AUX FIBRES DE L'EAU attracted attention: the project accentuates the singularity of each crossing and tests specific solutions to flood risks. LG243 ON DIAGRAMS develops a similar approach, with less detail.
- The jury appreciated the conceptual positioning of VZ408 MARGINALE (reflection on the margins, fringes and interstices) and expressed its wish to study the proposed spatialization in more detail during the second round.
- RS492 BLEUS ÉGARDS also attracted comment because of its metropolitan dimension. Its approach to the territory is less conventional, and it advances interesting proposals for openness and networking.
- Upon examination of several projects, a discussion began on the advisability and feasibility of moving traffic flows from the departmental road. The community confirmed that this response is possible and has already been considered.
- The jury noted that simply making a connection between the hillside and the bank brings exceptional benefits for nature and biodiversity. Relatively modest responses such as IQ764 TO WATER FIBERS combine ecology and simplicity. There is also the idea of finding places of proximity and familiarity with the Seine, in contrast with an attitude in which the river is often treated as a monument.
- UB234 PRICK THE BUBBLE was perceived as a different and original proposition.

# Final jury shortlist

Following discussions in front of the project panels and a vote:

From the projects proposed by the assessment committee, the jury chose:

for shortlisting: HA373 SOFT BANKS, IQ764 AUX FIBRES DE L'EAU, RS492 BLEUS ÉGARDS, UB234 PRICK THE BUBBLE,
 VZ408 MARGINALE

Among the other projects brought for consideration:

not shortlisted LG243 SUR LES CHEMINS DE TRAVERSE - ON THE BYWAYS

#### Opinions on other projects not selected

- YT987 L'ESTAMPE DE LA SEINE: A proposal based on the economic development of the site and the establishment
  of short local supply chains in the construction and reuse sector. Unfortunately the proposal loses structure through
  an excess of tools and intentions. The transition from concept and economic circuit diagrams to the architectural
  and landscape scale raises many financial and functional questions.
- XV035 COSMORYTHME SEINE: A project based around the textile production chain and adaptation to flood risks. Unfortunately the scale of the project project remains too large and a spatial and landscape proposal is lacking.
- ND318 VISIBLE INVISIBLE- DE LA GÉOLOGIE À LA LIBÉRATION DES VIVANTS: The project expresses an intention is to
  concentrate on three sites and conditions, which could have been strong and clear. However, the proposal remains
  very abstract and lacks coherence between scales.
- MM090 RATUMACOS: the making of a quay: A proposal based on the creation of new cross-links between the
  hillsides and the Seine, the creation of a large public space along the banks, the burying of the departmental road,
  and significant new activity spaces. These solutions are unconvincing due to a lack of realism and clear
  argumentation.
- LG243 SUR LES CHEMINS DE TRAVERSE ON THE BYWAYS: A submission based on a proposal for micro-interventions
  that can be implemented quickly and initiate a new relationship with the Seine. Unfortunately, the project is
  incomplete and the micro-interventions remain unclear both spatially and programmatically. While the story talks

about working with the rhythms of different natural environments and industry, the project only focuses on interventions for recreational uses and light mobility.

• EA717 INFRASTRUCTURE(S) FOR LIFE TO UNFOLD: A proposal at first glance, but one that is incomplete. The project makes strong choices (multiplication of built areas, intensification of natural spaces, creation of a new crossing), but remains too vague with respect to spatialization, function and process.

# **FLEURANCE**

#### Projects proposed for shortlisting

BI668 LE FLEURANSCOPE
GP153 TIMEKEEPERS
LD328 A CHANCE FOR TIMESCAPING
RC466 NEW GERSY
SI081 PIERRE FEUILLE CISEAUX
UR226 AIGA VIVA
WP075 INTERFACE

# Other projects <u>proposed for</u> consideration

by the site representatives: **TU617** ÊTRE VIVANT

by the jury: GM046 SOL SOL SOL

#### Projects selected by the jury

BI668 LE FLEURANSCOPE GM046 SOL SOL SOL RC466 NEW GERSY TU617 ÊTRE VIVANT SI081 PIERRE FEUILLE CISEAUX UR226 AIGA VIVA WP075 INTERFACE

# Presentation of the site by its representatives

Fleurance is a town of 6000 people in the centre of a population catchment of 19,000. As an urban centre, therefore, it is equivalent to a city of 10,000 inhabitants. A beneficiary of the *Small Towns of Tomorrow* programme, it is working to maintain its economic and industrial fabric and has significant needs in terms of mobility infrastructure and cultural and civic facilities. The Europan competition is an opportunity for the Municipality to enhance its attractiveness around a new project dynamic in the heart of the town at a time when housing vacancies are starting to decline. The project site consists of 3 blocks that have been disused for around ten years. It is a former agricultural cooperative (flour mill, silo and buildings from the 1950s) recently acquired by the municipality with a view to recreating a place for community and cultural life.

# Presentation of projects by the assessment committee

The assessment committee identified 4 project families: (1) territorial-scale projects, (2) more operational projects targeting wasteland, (3) projects on the theme of reuse, (4) projects on the theme of water.

# Reviews by site representatives

Several projects particularly attracted the Municipality's interest, including BI668 LE FLEURANSCOPE, a balanced proposal, and RC466 NEW GERSY which proposes a bold use of silos in housing. In others, the history of Fleurance is less apparent and THE Municipality is seeking insight from the jury. It asked for another project to be taken into consideration: TU617 ÊTRE VIVANT proposes interesting ideas for development and possesses a cultural dimension that the Municipality appreciated. The project also provides a response to housing needs, for example for young workers.

# Jury debate

Summary of the viewpoints expressed by the jury

- The jury questioned the scale and dimension of the project with respect to proposals that focus on the wasteland or provide a purely programmatic response. It hoped for more complete submissions, which work on public spaces or broaden the framework of reflection: for example UR226 AIGA VIVA uses water as a project activator, builds a link between the river and the territory and proposes an interesting overall approach.
- After discussions with the Municipality to clearly understand its intentions and the potential consequences of the
  competition, the jury confirmed the shortlist proposed by the assessment committee with the exception of two
  projects: doubts were expressed about the housing envisaged in LD328 A CHANCE FOR TIMESCAPING as the
  demonstration was considered too sketchy; the plastic expression in GP153 TIMEKEEPERS was very distinctive but
  the project is not precise enough.
- The jury welcomed the Municipality's proposal for the inclusion of TU617 ÊTRE VIVANT in the shortlist, a relatively modest proposal, certainly on a city scale, which deserved to be discussed in the second round.

 Finally, among the projects not shortlisted by the assessment committee, the jury asked for consideration to be given GM046 SOL SOL, which stands out for its approach to cultural themes. It proved to be very interesting in its setting of usage scenarios and made very expressive use of cartoon images.

# Final jury shortlist

Following a discussion in front of the panels and a vote:

Among the projects proposed by the assessment committee, the jury chose:

- for shortlisting: BI668 LE FLEURANSCOPE, RC466 NEW GERSY, SI081 PIERRE FEUILLE CISEAUX, UR226 AIGA VIVA, WP075 INTERFACE
- not shortlisted: GP153 TIMEKEEPERS, LD328 A CHANCE FOR TIMESCAPING,

Among the other projects proposed for consideration:

shortlisted: TU617 ÊTRE VIVANT, GM046 SOL SOL SOL

#### **BERNAY - TERRE DE NORMANDIE**

# **Projects proposed for shortlisting**

EV436 EN SUEUR
KB537 (RE)SOURCES
FH310 COCOONS OF CARE
EQ102 MAGNIFYING GLASS
UU913 EAUX COMMUNES
WL154 LES INTENSITÉS SAUVAGES

# Other projects <u>proposed for</u> <u>consideration</u>

by the site representatives:
HT694 LIAISONS TELLURIQUES
YG514 USINE (OU)VERTE
GR294 PRODUITS DU PAYSAGE
QV564 APRÈS L'ANTHROPOCÈNE

# Projects selected by the jury

EV436 EN SUEUR
GR294 PRODUITS DU PAYSAGE
HT694 LIAISONS TELLURIQUES
KB537 (RE)SOURCES
QV564 APRÈS L'ANTHROPOCÈNE
UU913 EAUX COMMUNES
WL154 LES INTENSITÉS SAUVAGES
YG514 USINE (OU)VERTE

# Presentation of the site by its representatives

The site representatives presented a dual objective: to convert industrial wasteland in a rural environment and to promote the heritage and natural resources of the territory. The four project sites, two private and two public, are connected by two valleys and two rivers. The buildings only accommodate a few storage activities. Locally there is real political and partnership commitment to reoccupy and reopen these brownfield sites and to work on interconnections through the landscape and the valleys. Each site (wasteland area in the heart of the town, recently abandoned factory, etc.) has its particularity and its history, and attachments within the population. "We are linked by geography and by landscape": this is how the strong identity of a former industrial and working-class valley is expressed today.

# Presentation of projects by the assessment committee

The assessment committee identified 5 themes addressed by the Europan teams: (1) the bioregion as a relevant scale of the living territory, (2) the already-there as collective capital and resource for the project, (3) the nonhuman living world, an agent of territorial transformation based on land, water or the animal kingdom, (4) wastelands as spaces are potential, (5) living legacies to preserve and transmit. 6 shortlist projects with clear-cut attitudes.

#### **Reviews by site representatives**

The Bernay Terre de Normandie intermunicipal district, the municipalities involved, the CAUE and the DDT, and the site owners, carried out an in-depth analysis of the projects, with particular attention to the economic and productive dimension and the desire to for the river to be considered as a strong territorial connector. The assessment by the site representatives differed in part from that of the Europan assessment committee.

The community <u>shares interest in</u>: KB537 (RE)SOURCES (the vision of the territory, the project approach and the phasing are clear and have the capacity to bring together the stakeholders) and EV436 EN SUEUR (the team develops a poetic and engaged vision, a reassuring and contextualised methodology).

The community <u>expressed doubts or reservations about</u> FH310 COCOONS OF CARE: the programming targets leisure activities or activities that have no economic reality in the territory or do not meet social expectations; WL154 LES INTENSITÉS SAUVAGES: this proposal raises the question of biodiversity but it is difficult to interpret and understand, and seems guided by the idea of a large-scale park that would require strong support from all the municipalities; UU913 EAUX COMMUNES: the concept is interesting but suggests a "punitive ecology"; EQ102 MAGNIFYING GLASS: the team's pointillist and dispersed approach does not really respond to the needs of the territory.

The community identified <u>four other projects that it wanted to see considered</u>, with the economic dimension as a common denominator: HT694 LIAISONS TELLURIQUES: although it does not develop a large territorial plan, the team gives a place to the productive economy (straw brick); QV564 APRÈS L'ANTHROPOCÈNE: the project relies on flax as a resource with the relocation of textile and non-textile production. The method, strategy and phasing are clear and transposable; YG514 USINE (OU)VERTE: this is a simple and feasible project. It conserves and reuses the built structures with principles of openness to the water and pathways between the sites. The team is interested in local resources and offers pragmatic solutions. GR294 PRODUITS DU PAYSAGE: the community is interested in the idea of the bioregional park and the possibility of maintaining production sites in a Natura 2000 zone.

# Jury debate

Summary of the viewpoints expressed by the jury

- The President of the jury thanked the "collective" of territory representatives and appreciated their commitment and their aspiration for a "major revitalization project" that would create possibilities to "live and work in the country", with a strong and laudable desire to revive local industries from a perspective of territorial ecology.
- At this stage of the competition, the jury fully shared and supported the community's choices based on solid argumentation. A consensus emerged to retain the community's 4 proposals without eliminating other teams which address themes just as strong as the economy: given the number of sites, 8 projects could be shortlisted for Bernay-Terres de Normandie.
- It would be a shame to favour only economic responses and not to consider factors such as valley floors, water, resilience, biodiversity. The jury agreed to retain a wide range of project attitudes in the shortlisting process, with geographical approaches in particular.
- However, there was a debate on the suitability of proposals that depend entirely on one sector, whether it be straw, flax or other resources, sometimes the products of intensive agriculture.
- The jury re-examined the projects proposed for shortlisting: EQ102 MAGNIFYING GLASS shows a very careful
  rendering but lacks force and a guiding idea; FH310 COCOONS OF CARE resembles a toolbox with relatively familiar
  modes of action, and does not fully respond to the challenges of the territory.
- Finally, the jury confirmed its interest in 4 projects to be discussed during the second round: EV436 EN SUEUR,
   KB537 (RE)SOURCES, UU913 EAUX COMMUNES, WL154 LES INTENSITÉS SAUVAGES.

# Final jury shortlist

Following discussions in front of the project panels and a vote:

Among the projects proposed by the assessment committee, the jury chose:

- shortlisted: EV436 EN SUEUR, KB537 (RE)SOURCES, UU913 EAUX COMMUNES, WL154 LES INTENSITÉS SAUVAGES
- not shortlisted: FH310 COCOONS OF CARE, EQ102 MAGNIFYING GLASS

Among the other projects proposed for consideration:

• <u>shortlisted</u>: GR294 PRODUITS DU PAYSAGE, HT694 LIENS TÉLLURIQUES, QV564 APRÈS L'ANTHROPOCÈNE, YG514 USINE (OU)VERTE

#### **NANTES**

Projects proposed for shortlisting	Other projects proposed for	Projects selected by the jury
	<u>consideration</u>	

AD243 ÉCOLOGIE DE LA RÉPARATION BA468 PACTE ALIMENTAIRE LIGÉRIEN HX007 METROPOLIS HOTEL NV801 L'ÎLE MYSTÉRIEUSE OO086 MATIÈRE PREMIÈRE QC465 DOWNSIZED NANTES WD811 RÉPARER LE VIVANT by the site representatives: **YO581** SOCLE COMMUN

by the jury: RY441 ENTRE TERRE ET SEL NV801 L'ÎLE MYSTÉRIEUSE YO581 SOCLE COMMUN BA468 PACTE ALIMENTAIRE LIGÉRIEN RY441 ENTRE TERRE ET SEL OO086 MATIÈRE PREMIÈRE QC465 DOWNSIZED NANTES

# Presentation of the site by its representatives

The Ile de Nantes University Hospital site will be vacated in 2027, having been a place of care and work since the 17th century. The challenge is to open up this very large and isolated enclave which occupies a central position in direct contact with the River Loire and in contact with Feydeau Island. The Municipality highlighted the need for renaturing and the desire for the project to include a nurturing dimension. It hoped that the reuse of buildings would convey an exemplary message of ecological and societal transition.

# Presentation of projects by the assessment committee

The assessment committee noted the great diversity of responses. With regard to the theme of the session theme, two main approaches could be identified: (1) "care for the site through the living world" (2) "care for the living world through the site"

# Reviews by site representatives

The Municipality thanked the teams for the quality of the projects and expressed its satisfaction with the variety of approaches. It shared the opinion of the assessment committee for: OO086 MATIÈRE PREMIÈRE: a well-supported project with good connection to the city centre, subtle proposals for intervention on the built fabric; QC465 DOWNSIZED NANTES has several points of interest, including its thinking around "geographic land" and "programmatic land"; BA468 PACTE ALIMENTAIRE LIGÉRIEN was much appreciated for the programming, with its focus on food and urban agriculture, the food park, the accretional nature of the phasing, the value of the urban agriculture project, reservations about the treatment of the bank. AD243 ÉCOLOGIE DE LA RÉPARATION focuses on the development of vegetation and an interesting bioclimatic approach, but certain interventions seem too cumbersome; the semantics of NV801 L'ÎLE MYSTÉRIEUSE are somewhat clumsy or "unfortunate", but its ideas about recycling and reuse deserve attention.

It <u>expressed doubts and reservations</u> about: WD811 RÉPARER LE VIVANT and HX007 METROPOLIS HOTEL, two proposals that are less well structured and less in line with the expectations of the City of Nantes.

It asked for YO581 SOCLE COMMUN to be brought forward for consideration, a submission that explores project governance and proposes participatory management of the site around the themes of refuge, care, slowness.

# Jury debate

Summary of the viewpoints expressed by the jury

- Nantes University Hospital is both an emblematic site and a textbook case found in other European cities faced with the need to re-purpose large hospital buildings. It is a very large and very complex site to tackle from the Europan perspective. Few teams have succeeded in treating both the architectural project and the urban project with the same acuity. There is sometimes a lack of an intermediate scale between the wider territory and the hospital site. Many "work around the building" without saying what they want to do with it. The teams are divided between two attitudes towards monumental scale: emphasising it or attenuating it.
- The jury members questioned the merits and sustainability of programme-centred projects and warned against the trap of moving from one very specific purpose to another. On a site of this size, the question is how to make space for ordinary urban elements, i.e. housing?
- There was a debate around demolition and partial demolition: to what extent is this acceptable architecturally and ecologically? Should the aim be to "destroy just what is necessary" in order to reshape the site or to "destroy a lot" in order to release land? Should "an unformed legacy" of successive additions be preserved?
- Projects that approach this built heritage in a progressive and incremental manner are more appropriate and relevant. The jury highlighted the contradiction presented by the AD243 ÉCOLOGIE DE LA RÉPARATION project, which it did not want to shortlist because of its bias towards demolition.



- Some projects do not go far enough on the land layout. Among the submissions not selected by the assessment committee, the jury focused on the debate around RY441 ENTRE TERRE ET SEL which presents clear and honest work on the land and its design.
- The jury welcomed the YO581 SOCLE COMMUN project proposed for consideration by the City for its analysis and its work based on the existing fabric and shared the criticisms addressed to HX007 METROPOLIS HOTEL and WD811 RÉPARER LE VIVANT which seemed too literal in its approach to the theme.

# Final jury shortlist

Following discussions in front of the project panels and a vote:

Among the projects proposed by the assessment committee, the jury chose:

- <u>shortlisted</u>: BA468 PACTE ALIMENTAIRE LIGÉRIEN, NV801 L'ÎLE MYSTÉRIEUSE, OO086 MATIÈRE PREMIÈRE, QC465 DOWNSIZED NANTES
- <u>not shortlisted:</u> AD243 ÉCOLOGIE DE LA RÉPARATION, HX007 METROPOLIS HOTEL, WD811 RÉPARER LE VIVANT Among the other projects proposed for consideration:
- shortlisted: YO581 SOCLE COMMUN, RY441 ENTRE TERRE ET SEL

#### **MARSEILLE**

# Projects proposed for shortlisting

VS104 LES FOLIES DES QUARTIERS NORD TT335 L'ENFANT, LA VILLE ET LE RUISSEAU LN313 BIOPARC NORD HY112 MARSEILLE NAUFRAGE JM299 L'ARBRE ET LA TORTUE RX566 DÉCOUVRE-MOI UNE RIVIÈRE

# Other projects <u>proposed for</u> <u>consideration</u>

by the site representatives:
FB310 LE GRAND RALENTISSEMENT
UQ800 MASSILIA SOILS SYSTEM

#### Projects selected by the jury

TT335 L'ENFANT, LA VILLE ET LE RUISSEAU
LN313 BIOPARC NORD
HY112 MARSEILLE NAUFRAGE
RX566 DÉCOUVRE-MOI UNE RIVIÈRE
FB310 LE GRAND RALENTISSEMENT
UQ800 MASSILIA SOILS SYSTEM

# Presentation of the site by its representatives

Marseille has had several experiences with Europan (12, 15 and 17). The proposed site is complex and composite: a large study area with several project sites, abandoned railways, a vanished coastal river and risks of flooding... The challenge is to rethink the metropolitan landscape, the identity of neighbourhoods, the hydrographic network and the living world.

# Presentation of projects by the assessment committee

A transversal analysis of the proposals revealed several project attitudes: (1) Connect: routes, roads, networks, (2) Take a step back: zoom out to understand, (3) Act through small distributed actions: acupuncture, (4) Democratise the project: governance and social issues.

# Reviews by site representatives

The representatives of the Metropolitan Region, of the City and of EuroMéditerranée saluted the work of the teams, which was often very detailed and covered numerous themes. HY112 MARSEILLE NAUFRAGE attracted real interest, with good ideas. RX566 DÉCOUVRE-MOI UNE RIVIÈRE is based on a very good large-scale analysis, which fits in with metropolitan strategies. TT335 L'ENFANT, LA VILLE ET LE RUISSEAU has very good intentions, but is it enough to make a project? Is this a major gateway to the transformation of this territory? LN313 BIOPARC NORD raised questions because it is difficult to understand and less defined in its operational grounding. JM299 L'ARBRE ET LA TORTUE focuses on the place of animals in the city. The introduction is interesting but remains limited. VS104 LES FOLIES DES QUARTIERS NORD is less convincing, in particular because it is not much based on nature.

The site representatives wanted <u>to add</u> two additional projects for consideration: FB310 LE GRAND RALENTISSEMENT is a project in several acts. It raises the question of time and a reduction in pace in response to the accelerated rate of EUROPAN 17 – French jury report

metropolitan change. The intervention on the interchange is very relevant. The project makes sense and is seen as very embodied in its argument; UQ800 MASSILIA SOILS SYSTEM was also identified for its discourse relating to the soil (pollution, flooding) and a transformation strategy with spatial, economic and social developments.

#### Jury debate

Summary of the viewpoints expressed by the jury

- The jury supported both the assessment committee's shortlist and the proposals of the Marseille representatives: FB310 LE GRAND RALENTISSEMENT carries a real message while developing a sensitive and ecological approach; UQ800 MASSILIA SOILS SYSTEM merits attention. The themes of time and land are foundational in this session.
- A debate is underway on the subject of climate-neutral cities and the heat spikes that we are facing and will continue to face, as well as the impacts of climate change. Three projects seriously address the ecological question with different focuses: HY112 MARSEILLE NAUFRAGE in particular, LN313 BIOPARC NORD with an open set of programmes in order to leave the field open in the light of future uncertainties, and RX566 DÉCOUVRE-MOI UNE RIVIÈRE which takes an interest in the wide geographical and hydraulic system.
- These approaches, with their broad and ambitious perspectives can be supplemented by more situated and more sensitive approaches able to involve civil society actors, for example TT335 L'ENFANT, LA VILLE ET LE RUISSEAU.
   These are indeed complementary approaches – the teams cannot be asked to resolve everything.
- The jury finally emphasised the excellent quality of the submissions in Marseille and agreed on wanting to highlight proposals that go beyond frameworks and perimeters that are too restricted: the question and the answer can be geographical; the jury must promote teams that will "look further or differently" across the different elements territory, climate, transport, processes and stakeholders. Following this discussion, two projects emerged as less strong or insufficiently large: VS104 LES FOLIES and JM299 L'ARBRE ET LA TORTUE, although each has its own qualities.

#### Final jury shortlist

Following discussions in front of the project panels and a vote: Among the projects proposed by the assessment committee, the jury chose:

- <u>shortlisted</u>: HY112 MARSEILLE NAUFRAGE, LN313 BIOPARC NORTH, RX566 DÉCOUVRE-MOI UNE RIVIÈRE, TT335 L'ENFANT, LA VILLE ET LE RUISSEAU
- not shortlisted: JM299 L'ARBRE ET LA TORTUE, VS104 LES FOLIES DES QUARTIERS NORD

Among the other projects proposed for consideration:

shortlisted: FB310 LE GRAND RALENTISSEMENT, UQ800 MASSILIA SOILS SYSTEM

#### **RENNES METROPOLE**

**Projects proposed for shortlisting** 

GK452 LA NEF
JM814 SANATORIUM
OI634 RESUSCITATING THE BLOSNE,
WK922 REGENÉ-RENNES
ZG079 CHAMPS - CONTRE-CHAMPS

Other projects <u>proposed for consideration</u>

by the site representatives: XE271 LA CITÉ FERTILE UO301 INFRA\_RE\_STRUCTURE

by the jury: **PA038** HOSPITALITÉ.S

Projects selected by the jury

OI634 RESUSCITATING THE BLOSNE WK922 REGENÉ-RENNES ZG079 CHAMPS - CONTRE-CHAMPS UO301 INFRA\_RE\_STRUCTURE PA038 HOSPITALITÉ.S

# Presentation of the site by its representatives

The representatives of Rennes Métropole described the challenges of a site on the edge of the archipelago city, the ring road and the Rennes green belt, and on the edge of a former ZUP (urban development zone) characterised by large roads roads. The conversion of the South Hospital is due to begin in 2027. The Europan projects provide insights into different stories and arguments and help to identify the conditions needed to bring this vitally important site back to life for the Blosne district and for the whole metropolitan region.

# Presentation of projects by the assessment committee

The assessment committee identified 5 families of projects: (1) cautious custodians of the existing fabric, (2) prodigals, confident in the participatory paradigm, (3) accumulator projects that promise rapid reactivation, (4) long-term refounding and anticipation projects, (5) responses 'by and with' architecture.

# Reviews by site representatives

At this first stage of the competition, the Métropole generally shares the opinion of the assessment committee, though with some reservations. OI634 RESUSCITATING THE BLOSNE offers an interesting wager on architecture. WK922 REGENÉ-RENNES is quite strong in the programming and processing of hospital extensions. ZG079 CHAMPS - CONTRE-CHAMPS shakes up ideas on this site, it makes sense in the archipelago city. GK452 LA NEF has qualities but does not attract full support, being seen as a process more than a project. JM814 SANATORIUM has good intentions but entails the removal of a useful ramp and requires a structure on piles. Connecting water from the Blosne and runoff water seems risky.

The representatives of Rennes Métropole wished <u>to bring</u> two other projects into consideration: UO301 INFRA\_RE\_STRUCTURE proposes a vision for both sides of the ring road. The proposal to cut and replant the boulevard creates a continuous park at the school level. The Métropole is sensitive to the proposal for a network of green interventions on the building, increasing its height and adding a double skin. XE271 LA CITÉ FERTILE, more conventional in design, was also identified (transitional approach to the building, new constructions interfacing with the neighbourhood).

# Jury debate

Summary of the viewpoints expressed by the jury

- Rennes has been known and recognised for decades for its implementation of the archipelago city as a way to
  reconcile density and urban quality. The concept also raises the architectural question of housing. This site would
  have merited other responses within the theme of living cities, to explore new qualities of life and new uses on this
  site. The question of urban metabolism, of incoming and outgoing urban flows, could also have been addressed.
  The jury noted that the teams had remained within a narrow framework and fixed programmatic matrices.
- However, it had found several good submissions among the preselection proposals: OI634 RESUSCITATING THE
  BLOSNE raises the subject of reconnection and renaturation to reestablish physical and ecological links. The
  principle of architectural extension deserves to be looked at more closely. WK922 REGENÉ-RENNES also has its
  place in the shortlist.
- ZG079 CHAMPS COUNTER-CHAMPS offers imaginative solutions around the issue of food and shows architectural and programmatic scalability. However, this proposal generated debate: is this idea of occupation applicable to the

scale of a 50,000 Sq.m building? Is such a project necessary or viable? There is a place for the activities of the nourishing city, but does it make sense here? Questions that need to be discussed again in the second jury round.

- The jury also wondered about the scale of the neighbourhood, the connections with the environment and the capacity of the site to accommodate ordinary urban life, in particular housing, which was poorly represented in the shortlist. Following an analysis of all the projects, the jury debated PA038 HOSPITALITÉ.S and proposed this project for the final preselection.
- UO301 INFRA\_RE\_STRUCTURE elicited mixed views regarding the elevation and the urban vision proposed by the team. The jury members differed in their response to the treatment of the interfaces and the south bank of the ring road. Is densification wanted? Does crossing the ring road make sense? For what purpose? Rennes Métropole confirmed that densification is indeed justified.
- Finally, the jury chose to to dismiss JM814 SANATORIUM which is in sharp contradiction with the main intention of
  the project in its proposal to rebuild a very expensive structure for very little ecological benefit. The jury was not
  impressed by Xe271 LA CITÉ FERTILE, which it deemed a serious but over-simple response, without much of the
  inventiveness typical of Europan. GK452 LA NEF was perceived as a metaphor that is ultimately not very effective,
  despite other qualities.

# Final jury shortlist

Following discussions in front of the project panels and a vote:

Among the projects proposed by the assessment committee, the jury chose:

- shortlisted: OI634 RESUSCITATING THE BLOSNE, WK922 REGENÉ-RENNES, ZG079 CHAMPS CONTRE-CHAMPS
- not shortlisted: GK452 LA NEF, JM814 SANATORIUM

Among the other projects proposed for consideration:

- shortlisted: UO301 INFRA RE STRUCTURE, PA038 HOSPITALITÉ.S
- not shortlisted: XE271 LA CITÉ FERTILE

#### **GRENOBLE ALPES MÉTROPOLE**

Drojects	proposed	for	chart	lictina
Projects	proposea	TOT	snort	iisting

BV650 FLOW FIELDS
EX423 (S)LOWLAND
HO818 SOLS MOBILES
LE290 LINKING COHABITATIONS
XW959 1ÈRE BOUCLE

# Other projects <u>proposed for</u> consideration

by the site representatives: JE666 - ISÈRE ENCHANTÉE YX016 GRE(EN)LINK

# Projects selected by the jury

BV650 FLOW FIELDS
EX423 (S)LOWLAND
HO818 SOLS MOBILES
LE290 LINKING COHABITATIONS
XW959 1ÈRE BOUCLE
JE666 - ISÈRE ENCHANTÉE

# Presentation of the site by its representatives

The Métropole is developing several major hubs, including the Isère loops which bring together 5 municipalities around the idea of a park city that fosters the presence of water for irrigation, cooling and agriculture, but also as a natural hazard. The Europan results should make it possible to involve local elected officials in a common project and to build a story based on the richness of the territory and the attachment of the inhabitants.

# Presentation of projects by the assessment committee

The assessment committee noted three factors of differentiation between the projects: (1) the attitude to natural risks: protective, flexible, inclusive, (2) the purpose assigned to the Isère park between infrastructure, environment, housing space, care space, (3) the shaping of a territorial story.

#### Reviews by site representatives

Elected municipal officials and the city's technical services were tasked with analysing the projects.

They shared the view of the <u>assessment committee</u> for XW959 1ÈRE BOUCLE, EX423 (S)LOWLAND and BV650 FLOW FIELDS which develop systemic approaches, tools, and attachments to urban space... LE290 LINKING COHABITATOINS was also appreciated for its sensitivity and its identification of intervention sites.

They <u>expressed reservations</u> about HO818 SOLS MOBILES. The team's vision was perceived as anxiety-provoking and entailed the extraction of fertile silt. It evokes associations with mining and extractive activities, which might be seen as questionable in the light of flood risk on the site.

They were keen to put forward two other projects for consideration: the first, JE666 - ISÈRE ENCHANTÉE - VERS UNE PLAINE ATTRACTIVE consists of a process of multiple landscape operations, proposing a method and identifying actors to activate the park. The approach seems relevant and applicable; the second, YX016 GRE(EN)LINK offers and orchestrates a route crossing the park like an aqueduct. This idea of a large footbridge caught the attention of elected officials, aware that the aim is not to create a work of art but to identify major connections within the park.

# Jury debate

Summary of the viewpoints expressed by the jury

- The jury showed its interest in the response to natural hazards in several projects (melting of glaciers, floods, droughts) which develop a posture of acceptance of risk and a unique perspective that reconciles the human and the non-human.
- A consensus quickly emerged around the assessment committee's shortlist.
- In discussion with the site representatives, the jury supported HO818 SOLS MOBILES. Relatively simple in its expression, this project stands out by asking real questions relating to the theme of the session. It explores the responsibility of each community over a larger territory, here the entire watershed. The actions proposed offer a potentially positive response to the climate change scenario. The analysis of the soil and water dynamics is well documented and the proposal is striking in its geographical representations.
- The jury responded favourably to JE666 ISÈRE ENCHANTÉE which can find its place in the shortlist with a different look and an orientation towards leisure and entertainment... Conversely, YX016 GRE(EN)LINK appears to contain a scaling error. The grand gesture of the line connecting two points, whether a footbridge or a path, appears dated and does not contribute significantly to the theme of the session.

# Final jury shortlist

Following discussions in front of the project panels and a vote: Among the projects proposed by the assessment committee, the jury chose:

 <u>shortlisted</u>: BV650 FLOW FIELDS, EX423 (S)LOWLAND, HO818 SOLS MOBILES, LE290 LINKING COHABITATIONS, XW959 1ÈRE BOUCLE

Among the other projects proposed for consideration:

shortlisted: JE666 - ISÈRE ENCHANTÉE
 not shortlisted: YX016 GRE(EN)LINK

# **GUÉRANDE**

#### Projects proposed for shortlisting

AD921 LE HÉRON QUI VOULAIT VOIR L'OCÉAN NC993 LA CLE DES CHAMPS XU794 TERRAQUÉ WI234 SUPPORT SUR PIERRE ZS363 PORTE À PORTE

#### Other projects proposed for consideration

by the site representatives:
LN989 WALKING THROUGH GUERANDE
JP580 LES TRAVERSEES DU SILLON DE BRETAGNE

Projects selected by the jury

XU794 TERRAQUÉ
AD921 LE HÉRON
NC993 LA CLE DES CHAMPS
ZS363 PORTE À PORTE
JP580 LES TRAVERSEES DU SILLON
DE BRETAGNE

# Presentation of the site by its representatives

Guérande is involved in the *Small Towns of Tomorrow programme* with games to attract tourists and residents. Its architectural and urban heritage is both an asset and a limitation. The city centre lacks coherence and links with other neighbourhoods, hence the idea of the green corridor. Participation in Europan reflects a desire to remake the city differently, to reduce car use, to better coordinate action on housing, mobility, nature, heritage, etc. in consultation with residents.

# Presentation of projects by the assessment committee

The transversal analysis of the proposals reveals two families of urban proposals on the scale of the city: (1) unitary approaches confirming a big motif of north-south connection, (2) fragmentary and more dispersed approaches based on networked public spaces.

#### Reviews by site representatives

The Municipality generally agreed with the proposed shortlist. NC993 LA CLE DES CHAMPS was well received by the elected officials, it meets expectations well. AD921 LE HÉRON QUI VOULAIT VOIR L'OCÉAN was also appreciated, since it is consistent with actions currently underway in the territory. ZS363 PORTE À PORTE provides interesting tools for handling public spaces and parking lots. WI234 SUPPORT SUR PIERRE offers pragmatic solutions but does not address nature in the city. XU794 TERRAQUÉ was less well understood and accepted by the elected officials. The general idea is well laid out but what is the operational grounding?

The Municipality wanted to add two other projects for consideration LN989 WALKING THROUGH GUERANDE attracted attention because it offers concrete proposals that are consistent with the city's projects. However, it lacks a landscape dimension. JP580 LES TRAVERSEES DU SILLON DE BRETAGNE is also of interest to the Municipality because it already takes the form of a guide plan and makes housing proposals that are well embedded in the territory.

# Jury debate

Summary of the viewpoints expressed by the jury

- Several projects take a broad view extending as far as the peninsula and explore the prospect of certain coastal
  areas becoming submerged. The strength of these geographical-scale projects is that they consider major changes
  affecting the town. The loss of salt marsh activity still seems a long way off, but it will happen. Teams that widen
  their focus show the richness of the territory, highlight the role of the town and establish links with local land and
  know-how.
- In this respect, three proposals stand out: NC993 LA CLE DES CHAMPS and AD921 LE HÉRON do a very good job of
  exploring the wider geography, the coastal ecosystems and the figure of the ramparts, with a very precise variation
  of scales; XU794 TERRAQUÉ develops a referenced and sourced approach, and is precise in its formatting with very
  fine graphics. The idea of starting from the urban centre and opening up to the south seems very appropriate.
- The jury raised the question of tourism, in connection with the problems of parking at the foot of the ramparts and tourist businesses that disconnect the city from the marshes. This subject was not really addressed by the teams.
- ZS363 PORTE À PORTE received mixed reviews. Some jury members found it interesting methodologically and in its
  revealing of project potential in several sectors of intervention beyond the scope of Europan; working in fragments
  makes the proposal both modest and operational. Conversely some jury members saw it as a relatively conventional
  and dated response.

- The jury appreciated JP580 LES TRAVERSEES DU SILLON DE BRETAGNE and felt that it deserves to be discussed and debated. In scale and expression it is closer to a study than a Europan project but it could constitute a good tool. LN989 WALKING THROUGH GUERANDE treats the three sites with sensitivity in dialogue with the inhabitants, but the jury considered it to be too limited spatially.
- The shortlisting of WI234 SUPPORT SUR PIERRE was also discussed. The proposal's focus on a material appeared somewhat anecdotal and the lack of ambition with regard to landscape and nature in the city raises questions about the connection with the session theme okay.

# Final jury shortlist

Following discussions in front of the project panels and a vote:

Among the projects proposed by the assessment committee, the jury chose:

- <u>shortlisted</u>: AD921 LE HÉRON QUI VOULAIT VOIR L'OCÉAN, NC993 LA CLE DES CHAMPS, XU794 TERRAQUÉ, ZS363 PORTE À PORTE
- not shortlisted: WI234 SUPPORT SUR PIERRE

Among the other projects proposed for consideration:

- shortlisted: JP580 LES TRAVERSEES DU SILLON DE BRETAGNE
- not shortlisted: LN989 WALKING THROUGH GUERANDE

# LE PALAIS - BELLE-ÎLE-EN-MER

#### **Projects proposed for shortlisting**

CK445 UNE BRÈVE HISTOIRE DE L'AIR GP356 PLUS QU'UN HORIZON MN093 MÉCANIQUE INSULAIRE NM945 INTERSTICES PO081 ARPENT-TISSAGE SG649 DÉFENDONS LES PALANTINS! SZ604 LES TRAVERSÉES

# Other projects proposed for consideration

BY THE SITE REPRESENTATIVES:
KY071 HEAL ESTATE
WF586 CHRONIQUE PALANTINE
QE406 TOUT AUTOUR DE L'ÎLE, IL Y A DE
L'EAU

by the jury: VG586 ALINE, LA ROCHE, L'EAU, LE LIN, LE LAIT Projects selected by the jury

SG649 DÉFENDONS LES PALANTINS!
SZ604 LES TRAVERSÉES
GP356 PLUS QU'UN HORIZON
NM945 INTERSTICES
CK445 UNE BRÈVE HISTOIRE DE L'AIR
PO081 ARPENT-TISSAGE
WF946 CHRONIQUE PALANTINE

# Presentation of the site by its representatives

Several subjects were raised: the port, the effects of rising water levels and marine submersion, the future of a former prison, public spaces, island autonomy (e.g. for waste)... The engagement with Europan is an opportunity to look for new ideas and concrete solutions for living well on the island. The municipality and its partners expressed great interest in these "thought-provoking" proposals. Everyone was excited by the analysis of the projects which led to a preference vote between elected officials, municipal services and residents.

#### Presentation of projects by the assessment committee

The projects combine several approaches: fallback or resilience strategies in response to climate change, the use of local materials, the design of public space, the architecture of infrastructure and built land (the port, the quay, the ramparts, the cliff), alternative incentive processes, an expansion of spatial and temporal scales.

# **Reviews by site representatives**

The representatives identified three main families of proposals: long-term projects that think about and work with climate change; landscape and architectural projects that have more of a design component but are sometimes less interesting than the graphics suggest; a wide range of "toolbox" projects. With regard to climate change, two opposing attitudes emerge: an attitude of resilience (dealing with nature) and an attitude of resistance (man against nature) with old infrastructure solutions: as such, the community would not wish to pursue MN093 MÉCANIQUE INSULAIRE and PO081 ARPENT-TISSAGE.

Several projects resonate with island concerns: GP356 PLUS QU'UN HORIZON, a FAIRLY detailed and precise, operational, rapid, but architecturally well designed project that attracted strong support from elected officials. SG649 DÉFENDONS LES PALANTINS! appears a very strong project based on a chronology from 1815 to 2100 covering land and sea movements. It cuts across multiple themes, including sociological themes. It shows very good understanding of the territory and brings new solutions. SZ604 LES TRAVERSÉES, with its beautiful landscaping work also attracted the municipality's attention.

The municipality wanted to add three other projects <u>for consideration</u>: WF586 CHRONIQUE PALANTINE: as a tool with its strong phasing; QE406 TOUT AUTOUR DE L'ÎLE, IL Y A DE L'EAU and KY071 HEAL ESTATE.

# Jury debate

- The jury thanked the representatives of Le Palais for their enthusiasm. The site is very inspiring and very emblematic of this Europan session: the island character, the metabolic imperative, seasonal demographic fluctuations, the exposure of the bastioned fortress to climate change... Cabaret discussion ensued on the coexistence between tourists and residents, the position of the tourist economy and the risks of over-development, on housing needs as well as on the logistical question which the teams had done little to address.
- The jury generally agreed with the proposed shortlist.
- CK445 UNE BRÈVE HISTOIRE DE L'AIR offers a reverse reading of the territory and highlights the wind as an invisible resource. The project includes public space qualities.
- GP356 PLUS QU'UN HORIZON raises reservations about the architectural drawing which lacks finesse, but deserves to be discussed in the second round.
- NM945 INTERSTICES was not cited by the municipality but the jury supported the value of this proposal for one-off interventions. The pencil rendering is both poetic and clumsy but it reveals a frugal approach, architectural design and detailed treatment. These modest, mobile or movable interventions can provide a response to the challenges of demographic fluctuations.
- SZ604 LES TRAVERSÉES expresses a rise in height and a step aside in the way of perceiving the island in its oceanic environment and in the heart of the elements. The project finely develops LES TRAVERSÉES and connections between the heart and the perimeter of the island.
- SG649 DÉFENDONS LES PALANTINS! stands out for its forward-looking quality and complex but very well-controlled scriptwriting. This is very ambitious work to be discussed in more detail during the second round.
- MN093 MÉCANIQUE INSULAIRE offers an interesting bird's eye view and addresses the question of habitat, but provides relatively conventional answers. The jury agreed with the view of the municipality on the limitations of [PHRASE TRONQUÉE]
- PO081 ARPENT-TISSAGE stands out for its work on agricultural production. One jury member would like
  consideration to be given to another proposal which addresses production sectors and systems more broadly:
  VG586 ALINE, LA ROCHE, L'EAU, LE LINEN, LE LAIT

Before the vote, the jury asked for clarification from the assessment committee on the four projects brought up for debate:

QE406 TOUT AUTOUR DE L'ÎLE, IL Y A DE L'EAU involves an interesting story about the place and the child's point
of view of the children but the answers given remain sketchy. KY071 HEAL ESTATE offers options for tactical
intervention but the project remains generic. WF586 CHRONIQUE PALANTINE provides a very good reading of the
context and adopts a sensitive approach. The proposal is similar to a very finely drawn diagnosis. VG586 ALINE, LA
ROCK, L'EAU, LE LINEN, LE LAIT is a response entirely focused on materials and sectors but lacks sufficient
knowledge of the economic functioning of the island which is already very advanced on these issues.

# Final jury shortlist

Following discussions in front of the project panels and a vote:

<u>Among the projects proposed by the assessment committee, the jury chose:</u>

- <u>shortlisted</u>: SG649 DÉFENDONS LES PALANTINS !, SZ604 LES TRAVERSÉES, GP356 PLUS QU'UN HORIZON, NM945 INTERSTICES, CK445 UNE BRÈVE HISTOIRE DE L'AIR, PO081 ARPENT-TISSAGE
- not shortlisted: MN093 MÉCANIQUE INSULAIRE

Among the other projects proposed for consideration:

• shortlisted: WF946 CHRONIQUE PALANTINE

• <u>not shortlisted:</u> QE406 TOUT AUTOUR DE L'ÎLE, IL Y A DE L'EAU, KY071 HEAL ESTATE, VG586 ALINE, LA ROCHE, L'EAU, LE LIN, LE LAIT.

# 3. SECOND JURY PHASE

# NOVEMBER 16 and 17, 2023

The second round of the French jury for Europan 17 was held at the Cité de l'architecture et du patrimoine in Paris. François LECLERCQ spoke of the participation of the jury members at the European forum in Vienna. He had been impressed by the enthusiasm shown by European towns and cities. The forum is a time for sharing ideas and achievements which reflects strong demand from municipalities, particularly on new forms of "design for inhabiting". He had learned from this experience that the Europan projects presented during these forums are "thought banners" but must also bear "the capacity to take action". Alain MAUGARD also highlighted how the spirit of Europan had been adopted and the consolidation of a European culture built around the competition themes (adaptable city, productive city, living city).

#### METHOD AND CONDUCT OF THE SECOND JURY PHASE

#### For each site:

- The jury welcomes the site representatives
- The shortlisted projects are announced in the presence of the site representatives
- The jury debates and chooses the three winning projects site by site

At the end of the two days of jury deliberations, the jury votes on the **30** projects selected in order to divide the teams into Winners, Runners-up and Special Mentions, independently of the sites.

In the order of the Jury 2 sessions:

# **COURCY – GRAND REIMS**

# **Shortlisted projects**

- BS175 MACRORAINBOW
- DP975 JEU DE SOCIÉTÉ(S)
- EV487 GEOBASE 112
- RJ033 SOLSTICE OU LE CONTRAT VIVANT
- SD149 RASE-MOTTE
- VJ312 OPERATION RE.MEDIATION

# Reviews by site representatives

Following the shortlisting process, Courcy City Hall and representatives of the Microville SCIC set up a local committee made up of residents and a representative of the Greater Reims urban community. The residents are stakeholders in the project, their opinion will be predominant throughout the project and its development. They paid tribute to the impressive work produced by the teams. Of the 6 shortlisted submissions, 3 projects received positive feedback, the other 3 gave rise to misunderstandings or questions.

BS175 MACRORAINBOW was appreciated by the local committee, which found it readable and consistent in its phasing with local dynamics and projects currently under consideration on the air base. DP975 JEU DE SOCIÉTÉ(S) offers a range of tools that can be implemented by future users of the site. The toolbox is valuable as a source of future support for investors or operators. But it would need to be associated with another project. EV487 GEOBASE 112 highlights agriculture and agroecology, unifying subjects for the municipality.

SD149 RASE-MOTTE was considered interesting on a conceptual level but not sufficiently in accord with the expectations of the community. RJ033 SOLSTICE OU LE CONTRAT VIVANT is attractive in its subject and delivers beautiful representations but lacks concreteness. VJ312 OPERATION RE.MEDIATION does not resonate with the population: it places the emphasis on a painful warlike past and this memory generates tensions locally. Despite the quality of the project and the extent of the work carried out, the community does not find the approach positive.

# Jury debate

- The jury began the debate on two major divergences revealed by the diversity of the teams' approaches, between "process" projects and "vision" projects, between operational responses inside the perimeter of the site and "responses that go beyond the site and consider it from afar."
- For part of the jury, the idea of the project-process, discussed at length in Vienna, is in Europan's DNA, one of the fundamentals of the project, necessary in order to mobilise stakeholders: on the basis of strong ideas to select, discuss or reject, how can all stakeholders become co-authors of the project? As such, DP975 JEU DE SOCIÉTÉ(S) is noteworthy because it is part of a process of iteration and support for each person entering the Microville cooperative with thematic challenges (energy, reuse, etc.). Other voices on the jury emphasised that "process alone is pointless if it is not sustained by a prior vision". They expressed their perplexity when faced by projects which do not express a clear vision or position and were less positive about DP975 JEU DE SOCIÉTÉ(S), which they perceived as an "urbanistic meccano", intellectually useful but lacking in courage in the site. In the case of Courcy, the actors and the method are already in place: why "add a game to a game that is already there"? Why complicate the process when what is expected is answers on architecture, landscape, heritage? Don't the numerous toolbox projects seen in Europan suggest that everyone can become an urban planner for a kit project?
- Among the more obviously operational responses, the jury questioned their critical scope and their distanciation
  within the Europan framework. In this respect, they found MACRORAINBOW more conventional and lacking critical
  distance from the brief and from the theme with new constructions on a site like this. SD149 RASE-MOTTE came
  across as a very good project with careful consideration of the method. It has more potential than EV487 GEOBASE
  112 which lacks strength in relation to the theme. But these projects, seen as more operational and essentially
  methodological projects, are not effective in constructing a story.
- The jury then discussed the proposals that go beyond the scale of the site and carry broader messages, recalling the purpose and role of Europan: it is not a conventional competition it aims to regenerate and shake up ideas, starting out from "immaterial considerations leading to the material". Two projects in particular were discussed: VJ312 OPERATION RE.MEDIATION and RJ033 SOLSTICE OU LE CONTRAT VIVANT
- VJ312 OPERATION RE.MEDIATION advances a sensitive subject for the city but it is meaningful and goes a long way
  with the idea of repair and care for the living world, which is apparent in the drawing and the details. Paradoxically,
  it brings a pacifying dimension to the relationship between humans and nature. The jury also noted its meticulous
  approach to military architecture. The project has undeniable qualities but its discourse can appear dichotomous.
  Can the project be founded on a post-traumatic vision? The jury agreed on the need to look beyond the war-related
  opening gambit to appreciate the great richness of the discussion on living things and the concept of remediation.
- RJ033 SOLSTICE OU LE CONTRAT VIVANT presents a fine and relevant response to the theme of the session. It goes
  a long way in ecological thinking supported by very beautiful qualities of graphic expression. The jury debated this
  rather unique proposal which creates a "world in itself" with a dreamlike dimension. Its main strength is its
  openness to the territory via agricultural themes.

<u>Position of the jury</u>: the jury underlined the strange and singular character of the site, which does not seem linked to an urban system and raises a question of attachment and belonging. One of these attachment points is the story, partly obscured though it is. The jury took a position in favour of projects that bring new or different visions and ideas from the approaches already pursued and implemented by the actors in place. The three projects finally selected constituted a compromise between Europan's reflexive ambition and the intentions already expressed by the city and the SCIC with a view to encouraging the follow-on from the competition with teams with complementary ideas and talents.

#### **Final selection**

The jury voted as follows:

- <u>selected</u>: RJ033 SOLSTICE OU LE CONTRAT VIVANT, SD149 RASE-MOTTE and VJ312 OPERATION RE.MEDIATION.
- not selected: BS175 MACRORAINBOW, EV487 GEOBASE 112 and DP975 JEU DE SOCIÉTÉ(S)

# LE PALAIS – BELLE-ÎLE-EN-MER

# **Shortlisted projects**

- CK410 UNE BRÈVE HISTOIRE DE L'AIR
- GP356 PLUS QU'UN HORIZON
- NM945 INTERSTICES
- PO081 ARPENT-TISSAGE
- SG469 DÉFENDONS LES PALANTINS!
- SZ604 LES TRAVERSÉES
- WF946 CHRONIQUE PALANTINE

#### Reviews by site representatives

The analysis of the projects was carried out by a mix of elected officials and representatives from municipal services. Three projects attracted attention. They are complementary and share the characteristic of considering a large area. SG469 DÉFENDONS LES PALANTINS! Encompasses two timescales, both looking forward and proposing short-term actions that correspond to current concerns. The historical analysis is relevant. GP356 PLUS QU'UN HORIZON is seen as an "operational project" in which the urban and architectural approach is based on a good understanding of the site. CK410 UNE BRÈVE HISTOIRE DE L'AIR is a multifunctional toolbox which is also of interest to the municipality, in particular for the development of public spaces.

NM945 INTERSTICES, considered too conceptual, was a source of internal debate and of misunderstanding. SZ604 LES TRAVERSÉES and PO081 ARPENT-TISSAGE offer an approach to insularity that is interesting but less relevant on first analysis. The site representatives wanted to discuss the strengths of these proposals with the jury members. WF946 CHRONIQUE PALANTINE, brought up by the municipality during the first jury round, no longer elicited the same same interest. The municipality highlighted gaps on the issue of mobility and transport: the teams tended to see the port as a showcase rather than a place of flows. The environmental approach is not always appropriate to the island and questions of nature and biodiversity do not feature strongly in the projects.

The site representatives expressed their desire to have the teams work together for the remainder of the competition.

Please note: the debate was conducted by video because a powerful storm on the day of the session prevented the site representatives from leaving Belle-Île to go to Paris.

- The Belle-Île site has a very significant role in this Europan session, accentuated by the climatic event: it forces us to go beyond the idea of an "ongoing transition" to more distant objectives in order to "propose answers to what is happening to us now and not in 2050": this idea should guide the jury in its selection of projects. Which are the ones that tackle the real questions and consider the vulnerability of the island, the question of submersion, the responses to isolation? From this perspective, two of the eight projects quickly obtained a consensus within the jury: SG469 DEFENDONS LES PALANTINS and SZ604 LES TRAVERSÉES.
- With a very structured message, SG469 DEFENDONS LES PALANTINS delivers a real adaptation strategy for the
  island. Climate change and rising water levels are at the heart of the project system. With explicit phasing, the team
  provides a method and courageously raises the question of dismantling the first front on the sea. It is a project
  which "helps you think", particularly skilful in methodology and timescales. The 2023-2050-2100 script is very well
  laid out and rendered.
- With an inversion of viewpoint, SZ604 LES TRAVERSÉES also takes a very strong position, focusing on flows and environments all the way up to the architectural scale. The jury noted the care and quality of the representations supporting the text, in particular the recognition that "the island is an inseparable whole, everything is linked and interdependent". The view proposed from the sea expresses the posture and qualities of the project and its resolution on a territorial scale. The proposition is also effective because it is posed at the right scale and remains on the threshold of an overly designed proposition.
- Compared to these two proposals, NM945 INTERSTICES caught the attention of the jury because it appears very complementary in approaching the question of rising water levels in a different way. The system of microinterventions is also relevant. The jury appreciated the analytical qualities and sensitivity of the team.

• The other shortlisted proposals are all of good quality. CK410 UNE BRÈVE HISTOIRE DE L'AIR does serious and careful work on public spaces, with an operational approach, but appears relatively fixed. GP356 PLUS QU'UN HORIZON develops an accurate perspective on the port and its facade which has the merit of raising the subject of this port entrance. It is a fairly precise and honest proposal in its architectural resolution, appreciated to varying degrees by the jury (debate on the project and the architectural expression). PO081 ARPENT-TISSAGE advances good ideas regarding routing and water management systems but appears incomplete. Finally, the jury was appreciative of the inclusive dimension of WF946 CHRONIQUE PALANTINE, but found the proposal less convincing with regard to the theme of the session.

# The jury voted as follows:

- selected: SG469 LET'S DÉFENDONS LES PALANTINS !, SZ604 CROSSINGS, NM945 INTERSTICES
- <u>not selected</u>: GP356 PLUS QU'UN HORIZON, CK410 UNE BRÈVE HISTOIRE DE L'AIR, PO081 ARPENT-TISSAGE, WF946 CHRONIQUE PALANTINE

### MÉTROPOLE ROUEN NORMANDIE

# **Shortlisted projects**

- HA373 SOFT BANKS
- IQ764 AUX FIBRES DE L'EAU
- RS492 BLEUS ÉGARDS BLEUS ÉGARDS
- UB234 PRICK THE BUBBLE
- VZ408 MARGINALE

#### Reviews by site representatives

The representatives of the Métropole noted that their thinking about this territory is still very open. The five shortlisted projects were able to adequately address the entire site. Some suggest shifting traffic to calm or rewild the road on the bank. This option was not considered by the Métropole which does not envisage major operations on this site. But the question deserves to be asked in order to think about mobility of all kinds, including active modes.

VZ408 MARGINALE conveys a certain sense of wisdom and respect for the site and its landscape with a logic of micro-interventions and consideration of potential flooding. IQ764 AUX FIBRES DE L'EAU also attracts interest for its approach to timescales and its potential to bring together the stakeholders involved, particularly businesses. It does interesting work on transversality and the link to the other shore in terms of the functioning of the territory. The community also appreciates RS492 BLEUS ÉGARDS, which is seen as a balanced project but depends on the repositioning of the road in Amfreville city centre, which requires less traffic. UB234 PRICK THE BUBBLE raises questions about the connection to the territory and the reactivation of a funicular. HA373 SOFT BANKS is seen as an out-of-scale proposal in its idea of reconstructing an island on the other shore. The project is interesting, but not relevant to community concerns.

- Before starting the debate, the jury asked the site representatives further questions: 1/ Should the intervention on
  this site be exemplary compared with other situations in the metropolis? Answer: this narrow valley situation is
  unique in the territory, it is a singularity. It is more with respect to the scale of the project and the relationship to
  the river that the community can draw more general lessons. 2/ What consequences are envisaged? Are there
  project initiatives underway? Answer: the site is still untouched because it works relatively well today.
- The jury noted that all the projects are delicate in their approach and require little intervention on the site. Jury members were surprised not to find projects that were more radical in their plans for the future, or which even reexamined the presence of industry. The proximity between the hillside and the river might demand more assertive proposals on questions of flooding and the renaturation of waterside habitat. The rewilding proposals are too pointillist and do not match the scale of the site. The jury noticed that the teams work in turn on these themes industry, rewilding, housing without making any firm choices on the treatment of the bank and the hillside.
- The jury shared with the site representatives their interest in two proposals that stand out: IQ764 AUX FIBERS DE L'EAU and VZ408 MARGINALE.

- IQ764 AUX FIBRES DE L'EAU takes the larger landscape into account. The proposal is rich, with a variation of proposals right up to the architectural design phase. The jury also noted the desire to connect visually, symbolically or physically to the banks of the river. The idea of reconnections also appears in VZ408 MARGINALE, which very carefully considers the interface and the limits linked to the history of the site. The rewilding proposals are relevant. These two projects, which are complementary in their treatment of transversality, succeed in talking about territorial ecology with a modest and incremental mode of intervention, "by touches".
- Two other very different projects were widely debated. RS492 BLEUS ÉGARDS has fine qualities of openness to the river and attracted the attention of the members of the jury interested in the treatment of floodability. HA373 SOFT BANKS project caused discussions within the jury on the scale and ambition to be assigned to rewilding actions, with two positions being expressed: the first welcomed the idea of widening the river and the desire to reconstitute natural islands as an ambitious response at the scale of the river; the second saw this as a return to "major works" on the natural environment, already heavily affected by the hand of man. HA373 SOFT BANKS is not fully complete but raises an essential subject on the future of partly artificialized river banks.
- Supported by several members of the jury, UB234 PRICK THE BUBBLE was the last project to be examined. Relatively
  discreet but rigorous in its expression, it works on possibilities for the modulation and reconfiguration of industrial
  objects and buildings and does not resort to functional zoning. While working with the question of life, it offers
  careful urban resolutions and a distinctive and original approach which stands out within the panel of shortlisted
  projects.
- Before the vote, a consensus emerged: none of the projects was clearly and obviously destined for the European winner list, but the jury wanted three complementary and combinable projects for the next stage of the competition, which will bring together the qualities of often very subtle proposals.

#### **Final selection**

The jury voted as follows:

- selected: IQ764 TO WATER FIBERS, VZ408 MARGINAL and UB234 PRICK THE BUBBLE
- not selected: RS492 BLUE EGARDS and HA373 SOFT BANKS

# **FLEURANCE**

# **Shortlisted projects**

- BI668 LE FLEURANSCOPE
- GM046 SOL SOL SOL
- RC466 NEW GERSY
- SI081 PIERRE FEUILLE CISEAUX
- TU617 ÊTRE VIVANT
- UR226 AIGA VIVA
- WP075 INTERFACE

# Reviews by the site representatives

The Mayor of Fleurance could not leave the town hall, so participated in the discussions by video, emphasising his desire for operational commitment. As in the first jury session, the Municipality was more appreciative of three projects (BI668 LE FLEURANSCOPE, RC466 NEW GERSY, TU617 ÊTRE VIVANT) but was keen to hear the jury's insights for the other proposals. At the request of the jury, the Mayor reiterated his expectations and the plans for the postcompetition phase: Fleurance is looking for a development guide plan and a mobility plan to bring residents back into the heart of the city and to reinforce the attractiveness and animation of the city through cultural facilities.

#### Jury debate

• The jury expressed difficulties in assessing the projects given the expectations of the Municipality, the diversity of the responses and the strong contrasts in the graphic choices used to convey the ideas on an architectural and urban scale. How they fitted into the theme was not always obvious. The question of housing and ways of inhabiting was also highlighted in assessing the projects submitted in Fleurance.

- Few projects draw on the heritage component of the city, the grid form of the bastide and the architectural and socio-historical particularity of towns surrounded by ramparts. The presence of industrial architecture and silos in a gridded space is an architectural subject.
- After examination of the projects, a first consensus emerged around two projects: BI668 LE FLEURANSCOPE and SI081 PIERRE FEUILLE CISAUX.
- BI668 LE FLEURANSCOPE was seen as a very accomplished proposition. It highlights the bastide and provides a clear
  answer on a morphological level, despite some reservations about the architecture. The project has great richness
  and takes strong positions on water, soil and living things.
- SI081 PIERRE FEUILLE CISAUX [STONE PAPER SCISSORS] also attracted interest because it raises the question of rehabilitation based on existing form and material and expresses a continuum in the history of architecture starting from the wasteland. The graphic expression of the ideas is successful. It lacks a territorial and urban dimension.
- Among the other proposals, UR226 AIGA VIVA offers an interesting geographical and landscape interpretation. The
  team relies on the development of the hydrographic network but the proposal seems out of step with a local climate
  more accustomed to droughts. GM046 SOL SOL SOL, spotted during the first jury session for its graphic qualities,
  raises the question of uses but pays less attention to the presence of nature. In both these projects, the way they
  attack the theme and the "announcement effect" are stimulating but the grounding is less convincing.
- Two proposals are of good quality but more conventional in design: TU617 ÊTRE VIVANT and WP075 INTERFACE
  appear as essentially morphological responses, seriously developed, but relatively conventional on the urban level
  with less strong contributions for the Europan theme.
- During the debate, the jury returned to RC466 NEW GERSY which developed a fairly abstract and original proposal. It brings ideas for inclusive programming, particularly housing. Although the team stops at the threshold of the architectural proposal, the jury was interested in the ideas proposed and the typological research.

#### **Final selection**

The jury voted as follows:

- selected: BI668 LE FLEURANSCOPE, RC466 NEW GERSY SI081 and SI081 PIERRE FEUILLE CISAUX
- not selected: GM046 SOL SOL , TU617 ÊTRE VIVANT, UR226 AIGA VIVA and WP075 INTERFACE

# **GUÉRANDE**

# **Shortlisted projects**

- AD921 LE HÉRON QUI VOULAIT VOIR L'OCEAN
- JP580 LES TRAVERSEES DU SILLON DE BRETAGNE
- NC993 LA CLE DES CHAMPS
- XU794 TERRAQUE
- ZS363 PORTE À PORTE

# **Reviews by site representatives**

After a further analysis of the projects, the municipality confirmed its interest in the projects submitted, in particular AD921 LE HÉRON QUI VOULAIT VOIR L'OCÉAN and ZS363 PORTE À PORTE for the links established with the fortified city. XU794 TERRAQUE also attracted municipal attention for its operational nature, expressed in planning objectives and clear phasing. These proposals reveal the proximity and richness of the wider landscape, the possibilities for reintroducing water into the city and alternative implementation tools. The municipality appreciated the territorial approach in AD921 LE HÉRON QUI VOULAIT VOIR L'OCÉAN while pointing out that the proposals relate to actions already undertaken but relating to the law on coastal areas and biodiversity preservation.

NC993 LA CLE DES CHAMPS is a project that contains interesting elements – the emphasis on biosourced construction echoes an approach that is already established – but the agri- or permaculture proposals do not seem suitable. The Municipality was more dubious about JP580 LES TRAVERSEES DU SILLON DE BRETAGNE.

The municipality is considering following the competition with a possible study assignment with one or more winning teams in connection with the *Small Towns of Tomorrow programme*.

# Jury debate

- After discussions with the municipality, a consensus quickly emerged between the members of the jury, which emphasised the overall quality of the proposals on this site.
- The jury particularly appreciated XU794 TERRAQUE which expresses strong sensitivity to the places, the territory and the population. With this very open project (in terms of reflection and scope), the team shows an ability to bring together conceptual and methodological components for a fair and readable strategy. It is a "cultured and intelligent" project with skilful use of representations: the methods of expression combine efficiency and poetry. The jury also recognised a capacity for innovation in the follow-on to the competition in connection with the theme.
- AD921 LE HÉRON QUI VOULAIT VOIR L'OCÉAN also attracted the jury, which appreciated its highly sensitive
  territorial analysis and its attention to the uses of the retrocoastal area and issues of submersion. It is a very
  complete proposal at different spatial scales ("the project seeks very distant attachments") and temporal scales
  (seasonal local life) capable of mobilising local actors and resources.
- A third proposal emerged in the debate: NC993 LA CLE DES CHAMPS seeks to establish synergies with agricultural
  production on the plateau and the emergence of biosourced construction sectors. The proposal shows the richness
  of the territory and the municipality's interest in opening it up to the wider landscape while providing local solutions
  in the treatment of urban public spaces.
- Compared with these three projects, the two other proposals ZS363 PORTE À PORTE and JP580 LES TRAVERSEES DU SILLON DE BRETAGNE appear a little less anchored and sensitive.

# **Final selection**

The jury voted as follows:

- Selected: XU794 TERRAQUE, AD921 LE HÉRON QUI VOULAIT VOIR L'OCÉAN, NC993 LA CLE DES CHAMPS
- not selected: ZS363 PORTE À PORTE and JP580 LES TRAVERSEES DU SILLON DE BRETAGNE

#### **MARSEILLE**

#### **Shortlisted projects**

- FB310 LE GRAND RALENTISSEMENT
- HY112 MARSEILLE NAUFRAGE
- LN313 BIOPARC NORD
- RX566 DÉCOUVRE-MOI UNE RIVIÈRE
- TT335 L'ENFANT, LA VILLE ET LE RUISSEAU
- UQ800 MASSILIA SOILS SYSTEM

# **Reviews by site representatives**

Representatives of the City of Marseille, the Metropolitan Region and EuroMéditeranée recalled the challenges of the site, the desire to reveal a fractured geography and the choice of several demonstrator sites for an approach aimed at crossing boundaries. The diversity of the Europan projects guided the dynamics and enthusiasm of the three partners of the Europan process in the service of "those who repair, shape, animate and experience the city". The projects were also presented and discussed in a class of middle school students.

The site representatives particularly appreciated FB310 LE GRAND RALENTISSEMENT which tackles the question of mobility head-on with concrete questions about the future of infrastructures. It responds to the current emphasis on Low Emission Zones and the removal of certain structures is not impossible. This approach may prove relevant or even necessary for uncovering the water network and reducing pollution. HY112 MARSEILLE NAUFRAGE is also of great interest in terms of its treatment of the hydraulic system and other subjects of reflection. The project fits well into the territory. The opening towards the north is pertinent, with a proposal for the Delorme sector on the edge of the Aygalades Park which responds well to the concerns of the community. UQ800 MASSILIA SOILS SYSTEM focuses its attention on soils. The project, very relevant in substance, seems more targeted and less open than other proposals. But it attracted the attention of the local communities because it provides operational elements that are of interest to the Municipality, the Metropolitan Region and EuroMediterranée.

TT335 L'ENFANT, LA VILLE ET LE RUISSEAU was well received. The team's vision and sensitive approach are motivating. But the project seems too incomplete on an urban level. LN313 BIOPARC NORD focuses its attention upstream with an overly theoretical approach and a less thorough physical translation than other projects on a territorial scale. RX566 DÉCOUVRE-MOI UNE RIVIÈRE is based on a sensitive analysis of the Aygalades site and the watershed but the project proposals remain too general.

# Jury debate

- The jury immediately saluted the exceptional quality of the responses with a wide variety of conceptual angles: time as an integral dimension of ecology, the notion of vulnerability accurately addressed... All the shortlisted projects were of a very high level, inspired by the geographical and social reality of the territory beyond preconceived images. Faced with this, the jury wanted to foster non-standard approaches "which go beyond boundaries" as suggested by the title of the site file: either by geographical enlargement, or by temporal enlargement, or by positioning themselves upstream of the planning process...
- FB310 LE GRAND RALENTISSEMENT project was debated within the jury before winning support: paradox must be accepted with "the idea of slowing down at a time of urgency". The response can be perceived as "too literal" but it has the merit of being very concrete and quite radical: "slowing down or stopping cars is already beyond" our urban heritage. Members of the jury considered the proposal not fully complete but it has strength and great scope in the competition of ideas. It would require a dialogue between local stakeholders to consider reductions or relocations of traffic.
- HY112 MARSEILLE NAUFRAGE also generated very mixed views. This forward scenario of rising water levels and and
  continuous droughts fits in with the repoliticisation of ecological discourse. Can disaster be seen as a creative act?
  Does this proposal, although remarkable, offer a credible alternative? Can the community take political
  responsibility for the underlying message? After analysis, the jury saluted the courage of the argument advanced
  by the team but regretted a problem of spatialisation and architectural resolution.
- The members of the jury also discussed approaches that focused on uses. TT335 L'ENFANT, LA VILLE ET LE RUISSEAU effects a change of viewpoint by adopting the child's gaze with the idea of a simple, frugal, ergonomic city, livable for all. In this way, the team invites us to look at the materiality of things and living things that we can see, touch, feel... The project loses a little of its strength in the proposals, which are drawn on a complex territory. Members of the jury were dubious about the translation from intention to reality while others defended a response that summons up the imagination "in an eminently fictional city". But the project is part of a demographic reality and carries a transgenerational message.
- Among the responses that invoke usage, RX566 DÉCOUVRE-MOI UNE RIVIÈRE fully and unanimously held the
  attention of the jury for its geographical scope and its detailed cartography. The team's statement was sourced and
  documented on the idea of ecological sovereignty, resulting in an "ecocentric proposal". The jury admired the
  cultural, legal and educational dimension of the proposal, which also offers potential for residents to be involved
  in the plans and life of the territory.
- In view of this wealth of proposals, two very good projects called for fewer comments: UQ800 MASSILIA SOILS SYSTEM deploys a set of concrete and operational tools that contribute to an approach and governance based on soil use and life. LN313 BIOPARC NORD also addresses the subject from a sociopolitical angle.

### **Final selection**

The jury voted as follows:

- <u>selected</u>: FB310 LE GRAND RALENTISSEMENT , RX566 DÉCOUVRE-MOI UNE RIVIÈRE , TT335 L'ENFANT, LA VILLE ET LE RUISSEAU
- not selected: HY112 MARSEILLE NAUFRAGE, LN313 BIOPARC NORD, UQ800 MASSILIA SOILS SYSTEM

# **NANTES**

# Selected: projects

- BA468 PACTE ALIMENTAIRE LIGÉRIEN
- NV801 L'ÎLE MYSTÉRIEUSE
- OO086 MATIÈRE PREMIÈRE
- QC465 DOWNSIZED NANTES
- RY441 ENTRE TERRE ET SEL
- YO581 SOCLE COMMUN

# **Reviews by site representatives**

Three projects were supported by the Municipality. OO086 MATIÈRE PREMIÈRE proposes opening up the landscape and the city centre towards the river by re-situating the cross within the landscape of Nantes' great monuments. In particular, the municipality emphasised the quality of the urban design, the secondary network used to irrigate the block and establish connections with adjacent neighbourhoods. QC465 DOWNSIZED NANTES appears a complete project but raises questions of readability and communication. The urban approach is conventional but the treatment of the base and the strategy of replanting the fringes were very well received. BA468 PACTE ALIMENTAIRE LIGÉRIEN is of interest to the community as a demonstrator project on food and urban agriculture issues. It brings several strong ideas (creation of a productive landscape, use of the river for urban logistics, learning dimension with the university programme) but the architectural approach is less convincing.

The municipality was disappointed by the autarchic operation of NV801 L'ÎLE MYSTÉRIEUSE, which does not break the isolation of the site. The choice of "0 demolition" is in contradiction with the desire to reintroduce living things through soil and plants. After a new analysis, the two projects brought up during the first jury session, YO581 SOCLE COMMUN and RY441 ENTRE TERRE ET SEL did not win the support of the municipality.

- The jury noted that few teams had brought a wider scale into their ideas and projects. It began the debate around the architectural and heritage value of the building, designed by the Reconstruction architect Michel Roux-Spitz. The building is not listed or classified but it is an exemplar of 20<sup>th</sup>-century architecture, a monument both "remarkable and monstrous". Several positions were expressed around the value and acceptability of certain acts of demolition. The jury adopted an open position on remodeling interventions on the site, including the cross building in particular, as proposed by OO086 MATIÈRE PREMIÈRE.
- On this subject, a debate opened up on the apparent paradox between the desire to reuse existing infrastructure and the desire to return to living soil: should one demolish to reach the soil? What what is the balance of the carbon footprint between reuse and demolition? Are the economy and deconstruction sectors sufficiently structured? The selection of projects provides a very interesting sample to evaluate this dilemma.
- OO086 MATIÈRE PREMIÈRE was a much discussed project: it remodels the site in a well-argued manner. Compared
  to other proposals, the jury appreciated the fairly complete work on the existing fabric, which does not primarily
  rely on a programme. The site remodeling proposal is very well managed and accurate in its dimensions. The jury
  highlighted the high quality of the urban proposal while calling for close-up work on architectural solutions.
- NV801 L'ÎLE MYSTÉRIEUSE stands out through its romanticised approach and the idea that the site does not
  necessarily have to be opened up. The argument of an autophagic transformation is simply and clearly presented.
  It opens up a broader deliberation on recycling. This alternative proposal considers more subtle openings and
  connections and the jury was appreciative of the work on interiorities.
- BA468 PACTE ALIMENTAIRE LIGÉRIEN is one of the very well designed and argued programmatic projects with the choice of a food and agricultural orientation, associated with training and research activities. The jury recognised the qualities of the proposal (rootedness in the neighbourhood, relationships with the territory, opening onto the Loire) but had contrasting views on two aspects. The first was the agricultural theme itself: the jury questioned the economic model, the relevance of this choice in relation to the situation and the size of the site. The second concerned a tendency to rely on a programme of uncertain sustainability more than on an analysis of the intrinsic qualities of the site.
- On a similar note, RY441 ENTRE TERRE ET SEL underlines the essential question of soil and divided the jury: one part considered it poorly connected with its environment, lacking urban quality or too theoretical in its expression;

other members emphasised the high quality of the ground floor plan and the axonometry, the way in which it addresses the issue of food, the relationship it seeks to establish between the building and living ecosystems.

Following these discussions, QC465 DOWNSIZED NANTES was seen as an interesting proposition in its analysis but
abstract in its proposals, particularly on the landscape level. The jury noted the attention paid to the ground and
the subsoil which is also found in YO581 SOCLE COMMUN, brought up during the first jury session, with an
interesting exercise on the porosity of the soil which takes on its meaning in a flood-prone site.

#### **Final selection**

The jury voted as follows:

- selected: BA468 PACTE ALIMENTAIRE LIGÉRIEN, NV801 L'ÎLE MYSTÉRIEUSE, OO086 MATIÈRE PREMIÈRE
- not selected: QC465 DOWNSIZED NANTES RY441 ENTRE TERRE ET SEL, YO581 SOCLE COMMUN

# **GRENOBLE ALPES MÉTROPOLE**

# Selected: projects

- BV650 FLOW FIELDS
- EX423 (S)LOWLAND
- HO818 SOLS MOBILES
- JE666 ISÈRE ENCHANTÉE
- LE290 LINKING COHABITATIONS
- XW959 1ÈRE BOUCLE

# Reviews by site representatives

The community is looking for "a global vision, a unifying project and a story" for the Boucles de l'Isère park as an instrument of links and cooperation between several municipalities. The site representatives noted the quality of the proposals received and shared their point of view. XW959 1ÈRE BOUCLE conveys the sense of a strong team with a good knowledge of the area. It offers a toolbox at several scales (Alpine geography) without over-developing the territory. The solutions appear realistic, pertinent and replicable. EX423 (S)LOWLAND stresses the relationship with water and contributes to a re-enchantment of the alluvial plain with a wealth of ideas. The team also proposes a process. These two projects, very well received by local stakeholders, are complementary.

Two other proposals also attracted attention: BV650 FLOW FIELDS has a fine-grained and sectoral approach to the park with its vocabulary of "connectors", "thresholds" to deal with city/nature boundaries. HO818 SOLS MOBILES also seems relevant but raises questions. It is seen as a manifesto project and raises questions relating to implementation. Finally LE290 LINKING COHABITATIONS (sensitive and graphic qualities) and JE666 ISÈRE ENCHANTÉE (multiplicity of interventions) seem less accomplished.

- The jury asked the community about its expectations and the follow-on from the competition: there is no quest for immediate operationality but a search for ideas, processes, vision and method to involve numerous local stakeholders. Europan can act as the trigger for new governance.
- The jury generally shared the Municipality's assessments of the first two projects cited. EX423 (S)LOWLAND deals
  skilfully with water and risk. The team connects issues of regeneration and territorial identity. XW959 1ÈRE LOOP
  proposes a convincing landscape framework then works in great detail on the natural ambiances. The complete
  landscape project.
- The idea of a large intermunicipal park connecting the periphery to the heart of the city is not new, it has been a familiar concept for several decades. Innovation is to be sought in the way in which ecological issues are addressed by linking the "very large" (modification of environments, climato-hydrological changes with the melting of glaciers) and the "very small" (environmental sensitivity of living things, uses). One project in particular unites these two scales: HO818 MOBILE SOILS.
- The jury thus focused on HO818 SOLS MOBILES which delivers an original response, reestablishes connections at the scale of the valley and the watershed, and succeeds in constructing a new representation of the park. The conceptualization of the subject, based on sediments, is well managed. The team reverses the point of view by

observing the site from a distance and offers a story that touches on geography and history by seeking to find the ancient loops of the river. The idea of storytelling seems very important for this site, in order to link and unite the municipalities which border and share the park.

- The three projects mentioned above are highly complementary and have the potential for experimentation to move from the large scale to local detail. The Grenoble site clearly represents one of Europan's major developments towards the territorial project, without neglecting other conceptual scales. The utopian dimension of these proposals is to be welcomed, in that it establishes the conditions for urbanism as a mix of strategic vision and tactical vision. Social acceptance of risk in these territories also requires a return to ecology. These proposals convey this message well with a certain modesty.
- Finally the jury expressed some reservations about BV650 FLOW FIELDS: a somewhat limited project? technological tourism? fear of risk? LE290 LINKING COHABITATIONS did not attract a lot of support but the jury noted that it is one of the only projects to ways the question of the built city. It culminates in some very fine proposals.

#### **Final selection**

The jury voted as follows:

- selected: EX423 (S)LOWLAND, HO818 MOVING FLOORS, XW959 1ST LOOP
- not selected: BV650 FLOW FIELDS, JE666 ISÈRE ENCHANTÉE, LE290 LINKING COHABITATIONS

#### **BERNAY – TERRE DE NORMANDIE**

# **Shortlisted projects**

- EV436 EN SUEUR
- GR294 PRODUITS DU PAYSAGE
- HT694 LIAISONS TELLURIQUES
- KB537 (RE)SOURCES
- QV564 APRÈS L'ANTHROPOCÈNE
- UU913 EAUX COMMUNES
- WL154 LES INTENSITÉS SAUVAGES
- YG514 USINE (OU)VERTE

# Reviews by site representatives

The site representatives spoke of their participation in the Europan forum in Vienna which reinforced their analysis of the proposals and their interest in the idea of a project-process. They set out their expectations: to have a vision and a method from which to build a territorial project. The shared ambition was already very strong and had been consolidated by the commitment to Europan. The territorial actors were open to ideas and even to utopia, alongside a requirement for local specificities to be taken into account. Also for consideration was the need to implement 4 projects on 4 sites which will evolve over different timeframes.

Four projects in particular attracted attention: EV436 EN SUEUR is very rich. The concept of "territorial sweating", the utopian dimension and the outline of a story triggered a wish to meet this team. QV564 APRÈS L'ANTHROPOCÈNE reexamines the economic model by relying on existing sectors. It creates a dialogue between elements of the landscape, notably the plateau-slope-valley system. KB537 (RE)SOURCES was seen as a complete project with water as a fundamental resource. The progressive and reflective methodology was perceived as reassuring for the community. YG514 USINE (OU)VERTE came across as an operational project. The opening up of the wastelands meets expectations. The proposal suggests reconciliation between biodiversity and productive activities.

- The jury first thanked the site representatives for their in-depth analysis, their motivation and their enthusiasm. It
  raised the question of the follow-on from the competition and the assignments allocated to the teams: the
  community would like to carry out swift pre-operational and support studies, on a site scale, involving the teams in
  dialogue. Nothing has been determined yet.
- The jury paid tribute to the overall quality and diversity of responses on this site. It was difficult to analyse and compare proposals for multi-site projects, especially considering how difficult it was for the teams teams to find the right positioning: given the scale of each site (what should be done with waste areas? how can they be reused?)

the YG514 USINE (OU)VERTE project is both imaginative and pragmatic in proposing "open worlds" but it lacks territorial force; if we territories considered (how to bring unity to the valley?), several projects show a path, explore the meaning of places and restore meaning on a large scale.

- Among these more territorial projects, two projects stand out strongly and have a utopian dimension: EV436 EN SUEUR and WL154 LES INTENSITÉS SAUVAGES, which were judged to be more successful than GR294 PRODUITS DU PAYSAGE.
- The jury admired the quality and strength of EV436 EN SUEUR for its very well-founded philosophical approach and the great visual qualities. The team approaches the issue of water in a completely new and original way, with a certain virtuosity in its approach.
- WL154 LES INTENSITÉS SAUVAGES addresses life in its primary dimension with the inclusion of biodiversity which
  could be reflected in the project plans. It offers an interesting "counterpart" to EV436 EN SUEUR for the territorial
  story.
- KB537 (RE)SOURCES was also noted by the jury, with a precise method ( "reveal, consolidate, perpetuate") and an
  intelligible approach to linking the sites together. The solutions in plan and section showing the presence of water
  are very relevant and demonstrate knowledge about water management. On this theme, it appears more
  accomplished than UU913 EAUX COMMUNES.
- A consensus gradually emerged around the different proposals. The jury, along with the municipality, was less convinced by the "sector projects", that is to say projects based on an economic sector: HT694 LIAISONS TELLURIQUES (straw sector) and QV564 APRÈS L'ANTHROPOCÈNE (linen)

#### **Final selection**

The jury voted as follows:

- selected: EV436 EN SUEUR, KB537 (RE)SOURCES, WL154 LES INTENSITÉS SAUVAGES.
- not selected: GR294 PRODUITS DU PAYSAGE, HT694 LIAISONS TELLURIQUES, QV564 APRÈS L'ANTHROPOCÈNE, UU913 EAUX COMMUNES, YG514 USINE (OU)VERTE.

# **RENNES MÉTROPOLE**

#### **Shortlisted projects**

- OI634 RESUSCITATING THE BLOSNE
- PA038 HOSPITALITÉ.S
- UO301 INFRA RE STRUCTURE
- WK922 REGENE-RENNES
- ZG079 CHAMP CONTRE-CHAMP

# **Reviews by site representatives**

Representatives of Rennes Métropole expressed their point of view on the projects: OI634 RESUSCITATING THE BLOSNE is a good response to the idea of the archipelago city and the city/countryside dialogue. It pays attention to nature while incorporating greater density on the hospital site. The prior framing is relevant.

Despite an insensitive representation and a somewhat harsh architectural expression, UO301 INFRA\_RE\_STRUCTURE conveys two very strong ideas: elevation (message of density, possibility of re-appropriating the distant landscape through the view) and the replanting of overlarge avenues. These two proposals could be adopted by the municipality and would be very useful in organising follow-ups and clarifying operational intentions. These two projects offer visions that differ from those of other projects.

WK922 REGENE-RENNES and PA038 HOSPITALITÉ.S are more about method than about architectural project and do not completely address the interfaces with the neighbourhood and the territory. Finally ZG079 CHAMP – CONTRE -CHAMP has a manifesto dimension based on a scholarly discourse and the idea of an "alternative chamber of agriculture". But is this the right place for it?

During the debate, Rennes Métropole referred to several decades of future demographic growth and the need to continue to accommodate activities, housing and workplaces in the heart of the city by means of greater density, including higher buildings.

# Jury debate

- Despite the diversity of responses, the jury was not completely convinced by the proposals, for several reasons: solid lines of thinking had been initiated but little achieved on the question of the living world and the land; on the question of densification or elevation; more generally on the architectural project, given that hospital architecture has undergone many changes. There is often a lack of resolution on the small scale, the ground design and land uses. Certain axonometric representations lead to functionalist outcomes.
- OI634 RESUSCITATING THE BLOSNE combines two strong ideas, which are not very closely related but very subtle. The idea of a metabolic structure that changes or enlarges the existing building is well represented with a very clear architectural approach. The rewilding of Blosne is thought of as a hook for the territory. But the team contradicts itself with the addition of buildings scattered on the site. This unnecessarily disrupts the simplicity and radicality of the response.
- ZG079 CHAMP COUNTER-CHAMP received a mixed reception from the jury: the text, the drawings and the scriptwriting are precise and accomplished, from the scale of the site to the planetary scale. The team envisions a sort of radiating city, with a multiplicity of uses, going down to the level of the architectural cross sections; the team demonstrates know-how and skills. But Is the programme valuable and relevant to this place and this heritage?
- WK922 REGENE-RENNES is a serious project, well designed and interesting in its programming strategy, with uses
  already identified and distributed across the site. The set of targeted demolitions is a response for many buildings
  swallowed up by successive extensions that end up occupying an entire plot.
- UO301 INFRA\_RE\_STRUCTURE raises two very relevant subjects: increasing the height of the building and transforming oversized avenues. The proposal is is only partially appealing, with a certain clumsiness of expression and representation. The architectural resolution of the elevation is very literal and not sufficiently worked out. South of the ring road, the accumulation of wind turbines, greenhouses and the route of the stream contradict the idea of rewilding. This is very unfortunate because height is a real issue, particularly for modern buildings where increased height is a possibility. After a further examination, the jury concluded that PA038 HOSPITALITÉ.S asks good questions but provides too few answers.
- Summing up the discussions, the jury noted that the projects identify two major figures on the site, the architectural
  entity of the hospital and the natural entity of the River Blosne. None of the projects appears to offer a strong and
  obvious way to bring these two figures together. But there is a wealth of options that can be brought into
  conversation by combining three complementary proposals: OI634 RESUSCITATING THE BLOSNE (two excellent
  incomplete ideas), ZG079 CHAMP-CONTRE CHAMP (great richness of subject and proposals for testing) WK922
  REGENE-RENNES (a subtle exercise on the base of the building).

# **Final selection**

The jury voted as follows:

- selected: OI634 RESUSCITATING THE BLOSNE, WK922 REGENE-RENNES and ZG079 CHAMP CONTRE-CHAMP
- not selected: PA038 HOSPITALITÉ.S and UO301 INFRA\_RE\_STRUCTURE

# 4. ALLOCATION OF PRIZES

At the end of the two jury days, the jury voted on the 30 selected projects in order to divide the prize-winning teams between Winners, Runners-up and Special Mentions, regardless of the sites.

# Winning projects

The jury selected 10 winning projects, which will receive an award of €12,000 in accordance with the competition rules.

BI668 LE FLEURANSCOPE	Winner	Fleurance
EV436 EN SUEUR	Winner	Bernay Terre de Normandie
HO818 SOLS MOBILES	Winner	Grenoble Alpes Métropole
OO086 MATIÈRE PREMIÈRE	Winner	Nantes
RJ033 SOLSTICE OU LE CONTRAT VIVANT	Winner	Courcy – Grand Reims
RX566 DÉCOUVRE-MOI UNE RIVIÈRE	Winner	Marseille
SG469 DÉFENDONS LES PALANTINS!	Winner	Le Palais
SZ604 LES TRAVERSÉES	Winner	Le Palais
VJ312 OPERATION RE.MEDIATION	Winner	Courcy – Grand Reims
XU794 TERRAQUE	Winner	Guérande

# Runner-up projects

The jury selected 10 runner-up projects, which will receive an award of €6000 in accordance with the competition rules.

IQ764 AUX FIBRES DE L'EAU	Runner-up	Métropole Rouen Normandie
UB234 PRICK THE BUBBLE	Runner-up	Métropole Rouen Normandie
WL154 LES INTENSITÉS SAUVAGES	Runner-up	Bernay Terre de Normandie
SI081 PIERRE FEUILLE CISEAUX	Runner-up	Fleurance
OI634 RESUSCITATING THE BLOSNE	Runner-up	Rennes Métropole
ZG079 CHAMP - CONTRE-CHAMP	Runner-up	Rennes Métropole
FB310 LE GRAND RALENTISSEMENT	Runner-up	Marseille
XW959 1ÈRE BOUCLE	Runner-up	Grenoble Alpes Métropole
AD921 LE HÉRON QUI VOULAIT VOIR L'OCEAN	Runner-up	Guérande
NM945 INTERSTICES	Runner-up	Le Palais

# **Special mention projects**

Le jury attribue 10 mentions spéciales inscrites au palmarès sans prime conformément au règlement du concours.

SD149 RASE-MOTTE	Mention spéciale	Courcy – Grand Reims
VZ408 MARGINALE	Special mention	Métropole Rouen Normandie
KB537 (RE)SOURCES	Special mention	Bernay Terre de Normandie
RC466 NEW GERSY	Special mention	Fleurance
NV801 L'ÎLE MYSTÉRIEUSE	Special mention	Nantes
BA468 PACTE ALIMENTAIRE LIGÉRIEN	Special mention	Nantes
WK922 REGENE-RENNES	Special mention	Rennes Métropole
TT335 L'ENFANT, LA VILLE ET LE RUISSEAU	Special mention	Marseille
EX423 (S)LOWLAND	Special mention	Grenoble Alpes Métropole
NC993 LA CLÉ DES CHAMPS	Special mention	Guérande

# List of award-winning projects and jury opinion

#### Courcy - Grand Reims

**RJ033 SOLSTICE OU LE CONTRAT VIVANT** 

Winner

The team responds to the theme of the session with the idea of a "living contract" established with the territory, drawing inspiration from Jean-Jacques Rousseau's social contract. The project takes the form of an agricultural park made up of laboratories and workshops connected by a network of valleys and hedgerows. New finely identified routes outline a framework of connection to the territory. The jury appreciated the qualities of this non-conformist response, idealised in certain aspects, which constructs a skilful story for the reconstitution of the former base. It underlined the finesse of the team's ecological thinking and the graphic qualities of the proposal reflecting a fineness of analysis and attention given to the soil question.

VJ312 OPERATION RE.MEDIATION

Winner

The project reflects the military history of the site and develops a more general statement on the repair of living environments affected by war, past conflicts or future natural disasters. All interventions and planned uses contribute to remediation through memory and the care devoted to the living world. The jury appreciated the geographical dimension of the proposal as well as the conceptual and allegorical approach which has value beyond the scale of the site itself. It highlighted the careful consideration of military architecture and the qualities of the project in its design and details. The richness of the subject of remediation takes us beyond the post-traumatic vision that appears on first reading. The jury therefore wanted to emphasise the team's sensitivity and the originality of its response to the theme of the session.

SD149 RASE-MOTTE

Special mention

The team wants to experiment on the Microville site with a "self-regenerative city" model and tools capable of generating "ecosystem services" for the common benefit of humans and non-humans. To do this, it develops a spatial and temporal matrix which functions as a tool of both analysis and project making. The response is both pragmatic and sophisticated, rigorous and very open. It requires a certain effort of analysis and understanding. Beyond the representational choices, the jury perceived in this matrix project both a potential for experimentation and a great wealth of proposals which is reflected in the graphic expression.

# Métropole Rouen Normandie

IQ764 AUX FIBRES DE L'EAU

Runner-up

The project focuses on "transverse fibres" of the Seine and outlines connections from hillside to river, connecting urban cores and helping to open up and resurrect economic areas. The proposals, precisely drawn, appear sensitive and adaptable. The jury emphasised the modesty of the team's words and the well-argued frugality of the project. It also provides one-off solutions to site flooding. The proposal was also considered interesting for its consideration of timescales and its capacity to bring together public and private actors, in particular economic actors. It also expressed the desire to bring together and connect the riverbanks by opening up very strong avenues for reflection on the functioning of the territory and consideration in the larger landscape.

**UB234 PRICK THE BUBBLE** 

Runner-up

This project is founded on the decompartmentalization of economic zones and more broadly the effects of disruption between uses, programmes and environments. It takes advantage of the contiguity between natural environments, productive zones and residential areas to re-establish synergies in a progressive process which includes nature, housing and collective amenities. The jury spotted and was keen to reward a proposal that, while seemingly discreet and modest, is inventive and rigorous in its responses. It provides a fruitful critique of the effects of zoning or micro-zoning on living environments. It offers a rich range of ideas for modulating or reconfiguring plots and industrial buildings.

VZ408 MARGINALE

Special mention

The project team approaches the site as an archipelago of islands and proposes fine work on the boundaries, interfaces and margins. The jury appreciated the distinctiveness of this proposal for light and precisely located interventions, which conveys a sense of wisdom and respect in the treatment of the site and its landscape. These micro-interventions are also part of the history of the site and its geographical, residential and productive evolution over the long term. And finally, the jury noted how the project considers the adaptation of the site to uses during periods of flooding.

# **Bernay Land of Normandy**

**EV436 EN SUEUR** 

Winner

A proposal particularly noted by the jury for its poetic and engaged vision as well as the relevance and originality of a very well argued philosophical discourse. The team has constructed the story of an inclusive and supportive community of all living things around their shared essential element: water. The jury saluted the team's invention of its own vocabulary around the sweat and perspiration of living things and territories during periods of warming. The project is very rich, part utopia, part political ecology. The project also possesses very beautiful visual qualities and real inventiveness in the expression of the project on different scales.

WL154 LES INTENSITÉS SAUVAGES

Runner-up

The team is developing the idea of a gradation of use intensities by human and non-human habitats, from the most "domestic" to the most "wild". In this project, she explores a dynamic and an economy of co-evolution based on local ecotourism, the regeneration of agricultural and artisanal lands and ecological engineering to allow the return of living species to the margins of the urban. The jury underlines the interest of this project as a premise for a broader reflection on the territory. It is part of a bioregional approach and attempts to address biodiversity topics which have their place in this Europan session.

KB537 (RE)SOURCES

Special mention

The team offers an intelligible, gradual and reflective approach to connecting project sites. The jury underlined the precision of the method which consists in revealing, consolidating and perpetuating the qualities and potential of the territory and built legacy. The jury also noted how the project made water a structural resource for the territory. The method and spatialisation of the proposals are very clear. The jury appreciated the cross-sectional work and the precision of the representation scales.

# Fleurance

**BI668 LE FLEURANSCOPE** 

Winner

The team draws on a detailed and comprehensive historical, social and urban analysis. It targets numerous project potentials by means of realistic actions that are attentive to the existing legacy. The jury noted the attention paid to the medieval form of the bastide and the clarity of the response on a morphological level. This is a comprehensive proposal which skilfully combines several aspects of the session theme: the regeneration of an old urban form, the management of shade and coolness in public space, and the uncovering and conservation of water.

SI081 PIERRE FEUILLE CISEAUX

Runner-up

The project is presented as the story of an inhabited and cooperative construction site which brings together the population and local actors to energise or create new local, social and circular economies around the theme of reuse. The proposal is skilfully conveyed by three photographs of the process. The jury wanted to highlight this rehabilitation project because it is based on the form and material of existing conditions, it approaches inherited architecture in its material dimension and considers the "wasteland" object as a resource, part of a continuum of architectural transformation.

**RC466 NEW GERSY** 

Special mention

The team proposes a unique project that explores the possibilities offered by existing built structures and integrates housing into the three project sites, particularly the old grain silos. Although the team stops at the threshold of the architectural proposal, the jury was interested in the proposed ideas and the typological research.

#### **Nantes**

00086 MATIÈRE PREMIÈRE

Winner

With a new urban, landscaped and hydraulic framework, the team proposes an opening up of the landscape and of the site towards the river to irrigate the island by means of a secondary network. The intervention on the structure and the cross building is subject to debate with respect to the heritage issue, but the proposal to remodel the site is very well controlled and accurate in its dimensions. The jury highlights the quality and scale of the work carried out by the team and its ability to be part of a project process and to pursue a vision on an urban and metropolitan scale.

NV801 L'ÎLE MYSTÉRIEUSE

**Special Mention** 

The team proposes a method of self-transformation conducted by the site on itself by combining transitional occupancies, the recycling of almost all the buildings and a gradual rewilding of the land. The analogy to the process of cell autophagy fits with a perspective of metabolic regeneration that is relevant in the competition of ideas stage. The jury appreciated a distinctive and well-argued position that complements other proposals. This alternative proposal to more interventionist scenarios works on the interiorities of the site and more subtle openings of the hospital footprint.

**BA468 PACTE ALIMENTAIRE LIGÉRIEN** 

Special mention

The team envisions the site as a metropolitan service, resource and training hub dedicated to food and farming. The project is presented as a nourishing inhabited park with housing created in the cross-shaped building at the heart of the site. The strength of the proposal essentially resides in this programmatic orientation and the logic of opening the site to the river and the surrounding neighbourhoods.

#### **Rennes Metropolis**

**OI634 RESUSCITATING THE BLOSNE** 

Runner-up

The project brings together two very strong guiding threads, one of landscape and the other architectural – on the one hand the rewilding of the Blosne on an urban scale, on the other the extension of an architectural model on the scale of the hospital building. The jury appreciated these two main ideas and the subtle intervention choices, in particular the metabolic structure attached to the existing building. These initial ideas still need to be brought together in order to consolidate the overall intelligence of the proposal.

ZG079 FIELD - COUNTER-FIELD

Runner-up

Very well written and very well presented, the project has a manifesto dimension that goes beyond the scale of the site and questions the feasibility of the concept. The argument on food responsibility is convincing, but the idea of a platform dedicated to agricultural transition elicited debate within the jury. However, it appreciated the extremely detailed analysis of the function of soils, from their organic dimension to planetary issues. The project also includes detailed architectural proposals that evoke another radiant city with a multiplicity of uses.

WK922 REGENE-RENNES

Special mention

By focusing on the hospital site, the team proposes very targeted demolitions to clarify the base and differentiate built volumes according to their new roles, with a complete redistribution of functions. Beyond a programming strategy centred on recycling and reuse activities, the jury noted the project's architectural scale qualities and its potential for the adaptation and transformation of an hospital legacy.

#### Marseille

RX566 DÉCOUVRE-MOI UNE RIVIÈRE

Winner

By treating the Aygalades stream as a living entity, the team conducts a careful mapping of the entire watershed. This geographical scale reflection constructs a cultural and community story around the water system and the coexistence between humans and nature. The jury saluted the scope of this theoretical, sourced and documented proposal, as well as the ecological dimension of a project that at different scales links the fundamental themes of soil, water and time. The reference to the legal status of nature and the idea of bio-cultural rights to support the ecological sovereignty of living environments responds well to the theme of the session.

#### FB310 LE GRAND RALENTISSEMENT

Runner-up

In response to the climate emergency and the acceleration of urban changes, the team counters with another perspective on time and the idea of a slowdown that can be approached from different perspectives: understanding the timescale of water and its infiltration, take the time to rewild, to reappropriate expressway infrastructure and slow down human traffic in the literal sense. This very embodied project very skilfully links urban ecology, mobility and concrete modes of intervention in the territory. The jury wanted to single out this proposal which places the question of temporalities at the heart of the living cities theme.

# TT335 L'ENFANT, LA VILLE ET LE RUISSEAU

Special Mention

The team skilfully links the fragility and vulnerability of territories and uses through a transgenerational story that focuses on the presence and imagination of children in the city. The project, which is aimed at both singular and universal users, sparked discussion within the jury. The posture seems relevant with respect to the sociology of Marseille and more generally in the idea of transmission between generations. The jury wanted to recognise this unique and sensitive, though unfinished, perspective by including it in the prize awards. Beyond its macro- and micro-territorial qualities, the project carries a message for Europan and our own responsibility towards the humans who are the heirs of our actions and decisions.

#### **Grenoble Alpes Métropole**

# **HO818 SOLS MOBILES**

Winner

The team puts forward a long-term argument for its proposal by considering the glacier melting that is already underway, future water shortages and the disruption of sedimentary dynamics on the scale of the watershed. Armed with this forward-looking scenario, it looks at the site from a distance and seeks new representations to bring the Boucles de l'Isère park into existence. The jury picked out this proposal for its originality and its ability to conceptualise and tell a story about a territory that continues to change with and through its sediments. The project also displays great qualities its work on soil, water and plants.

# XW959 1ÈRE BOUCLE

Runner-up

The project works by re-contextualising the site on the scale of the bioregion and the Alpine massif. It implements a plant strategy for the re-establishment of ecological continuities and is based on the networking of activities linked to soil fertility, agricultural food production and the reuse sectors. The jury appreciated this complete and well-controlled work, its relevant typology of intervention and its detailed proposals.

# EX423 (S)LOWLAND

Special mention

The proposal is part of the large family of project-processes, with this variant centred around the main purposes assigned to the three loops of the river. The jury particularly appreciated the way in which the project emphasises the relationship with water and deals with natural risks, particularly in sectors occupied by industry. Ecological regeneration actions appear precise and easily applicable.

#### Guerande

### XU794 TERRAQUE Winner

The team has developed a very detailed analysis of the site, its historical and heritage qualities, the proximity and the richness of the wider landscape. The project focuses on the reintroduction of water and pragmatic implementation tools. The jury praised the team's strong sensitivity to places, territory and people. It crosses perimeters and offers a number of openings on a spatial, conceptual and methodological level. The statement developed by the team is cultivated and convincing, reinforced by the efficiency and poetry of the choices of representation and graphic expression.

AD921 LE HÉRON QUI VOULAIT VOIR L'OCÉAN Runner-up

The team responds to the risks of marine submersion by creating refuge spaces in the coastal backcountry, allowing the restoration of ecosystems capable of absorbing climate trauma. In this philosophy, Guérande is seen as a "stationary city" which grows in density rather than in space. The jury wanted to highlight this sensitive and very comprehensive proposal which addresses seasonal cycles and the involvement of local stakeholders and resources. The scales of analysis and proposals are particularly well-argued to look for distant attachments with consideration for natural environments, public space and housing.

#### NC993 LA CLÉ DES CHAMPS

**Special Mention** 

The team repositions the city in the coastal geography and establishes synergies with the plateau's agricultural production and the emergence of bio-sourced construction sectors. This multi-scalar proposal shows the richness of the territory and the the advantage of the city in opening up to its wider landscape. The jury noted the clarity of the overall proposal and the finesse of the public space proposals, which give the project an operational character on several scales.

#### The palace

# SG469 DÉFENDONS LES PALANTINS!!

Winner

Integration of climate change, management of island resources, withdrawal of inhabitants and activities in the face of rising water levels, adaptations in housing forms and conditions: the team the relatives a global and comprehensive attitude by integrating several time horizons: 2025 - 2050 - 2100. The jury wanted to recognise the foresight and courage of this proposal which is both pragmatic and forward-looking. The project expresses an optimistic and proactive vision of current and future changes. Fully embedded in the theme of the session, the idea developed by the team provides a foundation for reflection and projection particularly suited to Belle-Île-en-mer but that is also transposable to other territories facing the retreat of the coastline.

#### SZ604 CROSSINGS

Winner

The team offers a unique point of view on the island landscape as viewed from the open sea. The questions posed by the theme of the session find their resolution at the scale of the wider territory, whether insular, maritime or terrestrial. The proposal weaves links between the valleys, focuses on the management of environments on an island scale by considering the impact of human flows. Beyond a certain complexity of interpretation, the jury emphasised the quality of this proposal and its graphic expression. The project is situated at the right scale, on the threshold of an overly designed project. The jury also observed and wanted to highlight the consideration of the island as "an inseparable whole", a message that resonates with global issues.

# NM945 INTERSTICES

Runner-up

The project presents itself as an ensemble of delicate additions and subtractions, thought out and negotiated on the scale of each place. The architectural and landscape interventions are measured while seeking the best outcomes for the transformed spaces and environments: the paths, the roads, the public spaces, the port... The jury noted the sensitivity of the team, the accuracy and the delicacy of the proposals but also, more generally, the idea of a process of transformation through micro-interventions that is complementary to more systemic approaches.